



Investigation of the Status of the Narrations and Narrators of *Nu'mānī* (Author of *al-Ghayba*) in Shi'a Hadith Sources up to the 10th Century AH

Kazem Ostadi*

M.A. Graduated, Quran and Hadith Sciences, University of Quran and Hadith, Qom, Iran.

(Received: October 2024, Accepted: January 2025)

DOI: 10.22034/hsr.2025.51616.1035

Abstract

The details of the life of *Muhammad ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Ja'far Nu'mānī* (b. 342 AH) are not entirely clear, and significant information about him is not readily available. Furthermore, one of the unclear aspects surrounding *Nu'mānī's* life is the extent to which Imamiyyah writers and scholars paid attention to *Nu'mānī's* narrations and the current book *al-Ghayba* attributed to him. Therefore, since some consider *Nu'mānī* to be among the prominent Imamiyyah scholars, it is necessary to investigate and research the "Status of *Nu'mānī's* narrations and narrators in early Shi'a hadith sources": 'What narrations from *Nu'mānī* exist among early Imamiyyah Shi'a hadith

* kazemostadi@gmail.com.

sources?’ ‘Who are *Nu‘mānī*’s narrators among the Imamiyyah Mashāyikh?’ And, focusing on *Nu‘mānī*’s narrations and narrators, ‘What is the extent of the attention paid by Imamiyyah scholars to *Nu‘mānī* and his works and narrations?’ The present study was conducted using a library-based approach, employing an inductive strategy and a descriptive-analytical method. Existing Shi’a hadith sources were explored, ultimately revealing that only sixteen narrations (repeated and unrepeated) from *Nu‘mānī* exist in a few sources from the regions of Iraq and Syria. On the other hand, and separate from common Imamiyyah sources, in examining the heritage of the *Ghulāt* (extremists), sources were found containing narrations from *Nu‘mānī*; however, none of these are found in Imamiyyah sources or Sunni sources. The majority of the narrators in the chains of transmission of *Nu‘mānī*’s narrations in these sources are disreputable narrators, leaders of the *Ghulāt*, or those interested in the *Ghulāt* heritage.

Keywords: *Al-Ghayba*, *Nu‘mānī*’s Narrators and Students, Mahdism, Imamiyyah Sources, *Ghulāt* Nasiriyyah.

Introduction

Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Ja‘far Nu‘mānī (d. 360 AH), also known as "*Ibn Abī Zaynab*," was a Shi’a scribe, hadith scholar, and possibly a theologian of the fourth century AH. It is said that during the time *Muḥammad ibn Ya‘qūb Kulaynī* resided in Baghdad, *Nu‘mānī* also lived there, benefiting from his presence and being among his students

112 (cf. *Nu‘mānī*, 1976 AD/1397 AH: 14-18). It has even been claimed

that *Muḥammad Nu'mānī* transcribed a significant portion of *Kulaynī's al-Kāfi*; some suggest this may be the reason for his fame as a scribe (cf. Tehrani, 1987 AD/1408 AH: 16, 79). However, according to some Shami and Nasiri sources, *Nu'mānī* served for a time as a government scribe or minister in Antioch; this may also account for his reputation as a scribe (for example, cf. 'Iṣmat al-Dawla, 2016: 665).

Several individuals have discussed *Nu'mānī* and his status (for example, cf. Majlisī, 1983: 14 and 40). However, perhaps the first person to mention *Nu'mānī*, albeit briefly, and describe his position was *Aḥmad Najāshī* (d. 450 AH), who even praised him, writing: "A Shaykh among our companions, of great stature, noble rank, sound creed, and knowledgeable in hadīth. He came to Baghdad, then went to Syria, and died there." (Najāshī, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 383)

Several works have also been attributed to *Muḥammad Nu'mānī*: 1. *al-Radd 'alā al-Isma'iliyya*; 2. *al-Farā'id*; 3. *Nathr al-Li'ālī*; 4. *al-Tasallī wa al-Taqwā*; 5. *al-Dalā'il*; 6. *al-Muḥkam wa al-Mutashābih*; 7. *Risāla fī Aṣnāf al-Qur'an*; 8. *Tafsīr Nu'mānī*; 9. *Kitab al-Ghayba* (cf. Najāshī, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 383; Nu'mānī, 1976 AD/1397 AH: Introduction).

The first five books are currently unavailable, and there is no reliable information about their content, quantity, or quality. The mentioned Qur'anic titles also appear to be unique, similar to *Tafsīr Nu'mānī*, which is considered a spurious attribution to *Nu'mānī* (cf. Ostadi, 1990 AD/1369 SH: entire text), meaning that there is strong evidence refuting this attribution (cf. for example: Shubayrī, 2006 AD/1385 SH: 18). Furthermore, a work titled *Rasāla al-Muḥkam wa al-Mutashābih* from

the tenth century has been published under the name of *Sayyid Murtaḍā* (cf. ‘Alam al-Hudā, 2010 AD/1389 SH: entire text). Some researchers even deny that these titles belong to either *Sayyid Murtaḍā* or *Nu‘mānī* (cf. Mūsāwī, 1989 AD/1368 SH: 28).

While numerous books have been attributed to *Nu‘mānī*, his works apparently did not receive much attention among early Imami scholars, although his book *al-Ghayba* enjoyed some degree of recognition (e.g., Ṭūsī, 1990 AD/1411 AH: 127). Currently, however, *Nu‘mānī*'s most famous and accessible work is his book *al-Ghayba*. It was written in the early period of the Greater Occultation, as the Imam's absence lengthened and intellectual confusion and wavering faith spread among Shi'a. *Nu‘mānī* authored it to address this problem (*Nu‘mānī*, 1976 AD/1397 AH: 19). In this book, he explains the matter of Imamate and the mystery of the twelfth Imam's occultation. Some extant manuscripts and printed editions contain approximately 26 chapters and 478 hadiths. However, the few surviving manuscripts vary somewhat in content (Ostadi, 2022 AD/1402 SH (b): Entire text).

1. Statement of the Problem

Based on available documents and biographies of *Nu‘mānī* (e.g., *Nu‘mānī*, 1976 AD/1397 AH: Introduction; Shubayrī, 2001 AD/1380 SH: Entire text), the dates of his birth and death, as well as details of his life, remain unclear, and significant information about him is lacking.

Furthermore, examination of extant manuscripts of *al-Ghayba*
114 attributed to *Nu‘mānī* reveals that only a small number (around 23)

exist, all but one being relatively recent (Ostadi, 2022 AD/1402 SH (a): Entire text). This contrast sharply with *Kamāl al-Dīn*, a similar work by Ṣadūq (d. 381 AH), which has over 150 extant manuscripts (Diraiti, 1391 SH: 4, 682). This situation raises a significant question: 'Were the manuscripts of *al-Ghayba* (or, more generally, the narrations attributed to Nu'mānī) not valued among Imami scholars, or were these manuscripts and narrations lost over time?'

Therefore, one of the unclear aspects surrounding the life and works of Nu'mānī is the extent to which Imamiyyah writers and scholars have paid attention to Nu'mānī's narrations and his book *al-Ghaybah*. Since Muḥammad Nu'mānī is considered one of the prominent Imamiyyah scholars of the fourth century AH, it is now necessary to investigate and research the "Status of Nu'mānī's narrations and narrators in early Shi'a hadith sources," addressing the following questions: 1. 'What narrations from Nu'mānī exist among the early Imamiyyah Shi'a hadith sources?' 'Who are the narrators of Nu'mānī among the Imamiyyah scholars?' And, focusing on Nu'mānī's narrations and narrators, 'What is the extent of the attention paid by Imamiyyah scholars to Nu'mānī and his works and narrations?'

The present study, considering these questions, aims to examine Nu'mānī's narrations and narrators in Shi'a sources up to the tenth century AH; to provide a concise summary of the status of these Nu'mānī narrations.

2. Background

Regarding Nu'mānī, the book *al-Ghaybah*, and its hadiths, apart from

the introduction to the printed edition of *al-Ghaybah*, various articles and works have been written; for example, some of them are:

- Ṭabasī, Najm al-Dīn (2001 AD/1380 SH), "A Look at *Nu'mānī's* Book of Occultation," *Expectation of the Promised One*, Autumn, no. 1;
- Shubayrī Zanjānī, Muḥammad Jawād (2001-2006 AD/1380-1385 SH), "*Nu'mānī* and the Sources of Occultation (1-10)," *Expectation of the Promised Imam Journal*, nos. 2-18;
- Mokhtari, Ali Reza, and Kazim Ghazi Zadeh (2007 AD/1386 SH), "An Analysis of the Hadiths of Occultation in *Nu'mānī's al-Ghaybah*," *Hadith Sciences*, no. 45;
- Ma'rifat, Muḥammad (2017 AD/1397 SH), "Re-identification of the Sources of the Hadiths of *Nu'mānī's al-Ghaybah*," *Shi'a Studies Journal*, vol. 4, no. 10, Spring;
- Shariati, Fahimeh (2017 AD/1397 SH), "A Comparative Analysis of the Differences in the Report of Occultation among *Nu'mānī*, Shaykh *Ṣadūq*, and Shaykh *Ṭūsī*," *Mahdavi Studies*, winter, no. 27;
- Ostadi, Kazim (2022 AD/1402 SH), "Introduction and Analysis of the Manuscript Copies of the Book *al-Ghaybah* Attributed to *Nu'mānī*," *Journal of Manuscript Studies*, vol. 1, no. 2.

Apart from some writings that have addressed the content of the narrations and the sources of the book *al-Ghaybah* itself, no independent and coherent research has been conducted so far on the examination of narrations quoted from *Nu'mānī* and his narrators in Shi'a sources; therefore, this present writing is apparently the first

3. The Status of Narrations and Narrators from *Nu'mānī* in Sources up to the Tenth Century

To better understand the narrations of *Nu'mānī* in Shi'a sources, it is appropriate to examine the status of the narrators of *Muḥammad ibn Ibrahīm Nu'mānī* from two perspectives: First, by searching through commonly used Shi'a sources; second, through the sources of the *Ghulāt* of Sham, which have been published and made available to researchers in recent decades, since the golden years of *Nu'mānī*'s life were spent in Aleppo (cf. Najāshī, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 383), an area where the *Nusayri Ghulāt* were concentrated.

We will first examine the commonly used sources in Imami Shi'ism.

3-1. Narrations and Narrators from *Nu'mānī* in Common Shi'a Sources

According to codicological evidence, manuscripts of *al-Ghayba* only reached the Eastern Mesopotamian region (i.e., the Iranian plateau and Khorasan) around the ninth and tenth centuries. Apparently, they were not accessible to scholars in these hadith centers before that time (Ostadi, 2020 AD/1400 SH: 28). Therefore, to examine the status of *Nu'mānī*'s narrators in Shi'a hadith sources, it is necessary to search and analyze at least the Shi'a hadith sources up to the tenth century.

After examining all available Shi'a hadith sources (based on hadith software), it was determined that no narration or hadith quoting *Nu'mānī* or his books exists in hadith sources from the 4th and 6th centuries. Only a few limited narrations are found in some limited sources from the 5th, 7th, 8th, and 9th centuries.

However, there are also ambiguous and unknown cases where references to "*Nu'mānī*" are unclear; that is, it is not certain which *Nu'mānī* is meant, and with what meaning. For better understanding, an example, which is not related to messianic discussions, is provided. In the book "*Jawābāt al-Masā'il al-Ṭarāblusīyāt al-Thānīya*," by *Sayyid Murtaḍā*, under *al-Mas'alah al-Ḥādīya 'Ashar* (discussion of what has been narrated concerning *Masūkh*), the questioner, while discussing metamorphosis, states: "...And *Nu'mānī* has narrated much on this matter, that the possibility of both abrogation and metamorphosis exists. Among the narrations he has cited is a long narration mentioned in the book *al-Tasallī wa al-Taqwā* and attributed to [Imam] *Ṣādiq* (AS); at the end of this narration, he says: And when an unbeliever is dying, the Messenger of God (PBUH), Ali (AS), Gabriel, and the Angel of Death are present beside him..."¹ (*Alam al-Hudā*, 1984 AD/1405 AH: 1, 350)

The book "*al-Tasallī wa-l-Taqwā*" no longer exists; more importantly, there is no clear and acceptable evidence to show that this book was actually written by *Muḥammad ibn Ibrahīm Nu'mānī*, the author of *al-Ghaybah*. Furthermore, *Nu'mānī*'s name in this reference by *al-Murtaḍā* is not a strong or clear indicator of which *Nu'mānī* is intended.

1. The original text is: Wa qad Rawā al-Nu'mānī Kathīran min Dhālik, Yaḥtamil al-Naskh wa al-Maskh ma'an, famimmā Ruwāh mā Awradahū fī kitāb al-Tasalīi wa al-Taqwā; wa Asnada ilal Ṣādiq (AS) hadith Ṭawīl, Yaqūlu fī Ākhirihī: Wa idhā Iḥṭadara al-Kāfir Ḥaḍarahu Rasūl Allāh (PBUH) wa Ali (AS) wa Jabra'il wa Malak al-Mawt.

Therefore, aside from these uncertainties, the findings regarding *Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm Nu'mānī* in Shi'a sources are as follows:

3-1-1. Narrations Attributed to Nu'mānī in the Fifth Century AH

In the fifth century AH, only two sources mention a limited number of narrations from *Muḥammad ibn Nu'mānī*:

A) Al-Ghaybah by al-Ṭūsī

Shaykh al-Ṭūsī's *al-Ghaybah* (d. 460 AH), written in Baghdad around 444-447 AH, contains approximately 505 narrations; however, only 9 narrations out of the 478 narrations in *Nu'mānī's al-Ghaybah* (according to the printed edition) are found in Sheikh al-Ṭūsī's *al-Ghaybah*. Two of these are duplicates, and one is not available in the edition of *Nu'mānī's al-Ghaybah* currently accessible to us.

In *Nu'mānī's al-Ghaybah*, at the end of Chapter Four, there is a section titled "On what has been narrated that the Imams are twelve, according to the Sunni," containing ten narrations. Eight of these are attributed to *Muḥammad ibn 'Uthmān*, and the texts of the narrations are quite similar. Two narrations (from *al-Wālabī* from *Jābir ibn Samura*) are almost identical (cf. Nu'mānī, 1976 AD/1397 AH: 102-111). Seven of these narrations by *Muḥammad ibn 'Uthmān* are found in al-Ṭūsī's *al-Ghaybah*; one of these seven is repeated twice in al-Ṭūsī's *al-Ghaybah*. All of *Muḥammad ibn 'Uthmān's* narrations (except the almost identical narration of *Jābir ibn Samura* in *Nu'mānī's al-Ghaybah*) are included in the section "From what has been narrated on this matter from the perspective of the opponents of the Shi'a." In the *Isnad* of the first narration, its chain of transmission

is fully cited back to Nu'mānī's *al-Ghaybah*; in the subsequent narrations, the *Isnads* are cited with the phrase "With this Isnad." These are:

Narration 1. *Mā Akhbaranī bihī Abū 'Abdillāh Aḥmad ibn 'Ubdūn al-Ma'rūf bi ibn al-Ḥāshir, Qāla Ḥaddathanī Abū al-Ḥusayn Muḥammad ibn Ali al-Shujā'ī al-Kātib, Qāla Akhbaranaā Abū 'Abdillāh Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm al-Ma'rūf bi ibn Abī Zaynab al-Nu'mānī al-Kātib, Qāla Akhbaranā Muḥammad ibn 'Uthmān ibn 'Allān al-Dhahabī al-Baghdādī bi Dimashq, Qāla Ḥaddathanā Abū Bakr ibn Abī Khaythama, Qāla Ḥaddathanī Ali ibn al-Ja'd, Qāla Ḥaddathanī Zuhair ibn Mu'āwīya 'an Zīyād ibn Khaythama 'an al-Aswad ibn Sa'īd al-Hamdānī, Qāla Samī'tu Jābir ibn Samura Yaqūl Samī'tu Rasūl Allāh* (Ṭūsī, 1990 AD/1411 AH: 127; also cf. Similar hadith: 120 and 123; also cf. Nu'mānī, 1976 AD/1397 AH: 102).

Narrations 2 to 7. And with this Isnad (chain of transmission) from *Muḥammad ibn 'Uthmān*, he said... (Seven consecutive narrations; two are repeated; making a total of eight narrations) (Ṭūsī, 1990 AD/1411 AH: 128-133; also cf. Nu'mānī, 1976 AD/1397 AH: 103-107).

Several points regarding these narrations are noteworthy:

First: All eight narrations in Ṭūsī's *al-Ghaybah*, which are also present in Nu'mānī's *al-Ghaybah*, are identical in terms of order and wording; only the eighth narration in Ṭūsī's version adds the phrase, "Allah the Almighty said, and We sent among them twelve chiefs." (cf. Ṭūsī, 1990 AD/1411 AH: 134) Furthermore, the eighth narration from this consecutive series in Nu'mānī's *al-Ghaybah* is not included

Therefore, considering the order of presentation in the two works, the textual consistency of these narrations with *Nu'mānī's al-Ghaybah*, and the absence of any indication of these narrations being newly written in the manuscript copies of *Ṭūsī's al-Ghaybah*, it can be strongly suggested that *Shaykh Ṭūsī* directly took these narrations from *Nu'mānī's* book; however, despite some differences, it is currently unclear which edition of *Nu'mānī's* book he utilized.

On the other hand, assuming this possibility, it needs to be explained 'Why *Shaykh Ṭūsī* did not include other narrations from this work?' And if he used some of them, 'Why did he not mention *Nu'mānī's* name in his *Isnads*?'

Second: Two narrations (in both *al-Ghaybah* of *Nu'mānī* and *al-Ghaybah* of *Ṭūsī*) from this group of *Muḥammad ibn 'Uthmān* are repeated. (cf. *Ṭūsī*, 1990 AD/1411 AH: 129; *Nu'mānī*, 1976 AD/1397 AH: 106). However, the type of repeated narration differs in both works.

Narration 8. Also, in *Ṭūsī's al-Ghaybah*, there is another narration with the *Isnad* of "*Abul Ḥusayn Shujā'ī*," which is not present in the current copies of *Nu'mānī's al-Ghaybah*:

Wa Akhbaranī Aīmad ibn 'Ubdūn al-Ma'rūf bi ibn al-Ḥāshir 'an Abī al-Ḥasan Muḥammad ibn Ali Shujā'ī al-Kātibi 'an Abī 'Abdillāh Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm al-Nu'mānī 'an Yūsuf ibn Aḥmad [Muhammad] al-Ja'farī, Qāla:... (cf. *Ṭūsī*, 1990 AD/1411 AH: 257)

B) Kanz al-Fawā'id

Abul Faṭḥ Muḥammad ibn 'Alī Karājākī Ṭarābulsī (d. 449 AH) in *Kanz al-Fawā'id* cites only one narration from *Nu'mānī* concerning

"What is *Ḥalāl* is *Ḥalāl* until the Day of Judgment, and what is *Ḥarām* is *Ḥarām* until the Day of Judgment," which is not found in *Nu'mānī's al-Ghaybah*:

Ḥaddathanī al-Shaykh Abū al-Marjī Muḥammad ibn Ali ibn Abi Ṭālib al-Baladīyy bil Qāhirah, Qāla Ḥaddathanā Ustādhī Abū 'Abdillāh Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Ja'far al-Nu'mānī Raḥimahū Allah 'an Abī al-'Abbās Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad ibn Sa'īd ibn 'Uqda al-Kūfī... (Karājaki, 1989 AD/1410 AH: 352)

3-1-2. Narrations Cited from *Nu'mānī* in the 7th Century

In the 7th century, only two narrations are cited from *Muḥammad ibn Nu'mānī* in two sources, both by *Ibn Ṭāwūs* (d. 664 AH):

A) Faraj al-Mahmūm

In *Ibn Ṭāwūs's Faraj al-Mahmūm*, only this narration was found:

Arwīhi bi Asānīdī ilā Abī 'Abdillāh Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Ja'far al-Nu'mānī al-Thiqah fī Kitāb al-Dalā'il fī al-Juz' al-Tāsi' fīmā fīh min Dalā'il Mawlānā Abī al-Ḥasan 'Alī ibn Mūsā al-Riḍā 'alayhi al-Salām Qāla Ḥaddathanā Muḥammad ibn Hammām Qāla... (Ibn Ṭāwūs, 1948 AD/1368 AH: 95)

B) Mahj al-Da'awāt

In *Ibn Ṭāwūs's Mahj al-Da'awāt*, only this narration was found:

Al-Shaykh 'Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn Yūsuf al-Ḥarrānī Qāla al-Shaykh Abū 'Abdillāh Muḥammad ibn 'Abdillāh ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Ja'far al-Nu'mānī al-Kātib Raḍīya Allāhu 'anhu Qāla Ḥaddathanā Abū 'Alī ibn Hammām Qāla Ḥaddathanī Ibrāhīm ibn Ishāq al-Nahāwandī 'an Abī 'Abdillāh al-Ḥusayn ibn 'Alī al-Ahwāzī 'an Abīhi

'an 'Alī ibn Mahzīyār Qāla Sami'tu Mawlāya Mūsā ibn Ja'far (AS) Yadu'ū bi Hādhā al-Du'ā' (Ibn Ṭāwūs, n.d.: 233).

3-1-3. Narrations Cited from Nu'mānī in the 9th Century

In the 9th century, only two sources cite a few limited narrations from *Muḥammad ibn Nu'mānī*:

A) Mukhtaṣar al-Baṣā'ir

In *Mukhtaṣar al-Baṣā'ir* by Ḥasan ibn Sulaymān Ḥillī (d. after 802 AH), four narrations are cited from Nu'mānī's *al-Ghaybah*:

1. Wa min Kitāb Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm al-Nu'mānī fī al-Ghaybah, Akhbaranā 'Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn, 'an Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā, 'an Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥasan al-Rāzī, 'an Muḥammad ibn 'Alī, 'an Muḥammad ibn Sinān, 'an Dāwūd ibn Kathīr al-Raqīyy Qāla: Qultu li Abī 'Abdillāh Ja'far (AS) ... (Ḥillī, 2000 AD/1421 AH: 427; also cf. Nu'mānī, 1976 AD/1397 AH: 90)
2. Mā Rawaynāhu 'an al-Nu'mānī min Kitāb al-Ghaybah laḥū Rafa'a al-Ḥadīth 'an Ḥamzah ibn Ḥumrān, 'an ibn Abī Ya'fūr, 'an Abī 'Abdillāh (AS) annahū Qāla... (Ḥillī, 2000 AD/1421 AH: 460; also cf. Nu'mānī, 1976 AD/1397 AH: 331)
3. Wa min Kitāb al-Ghaybah li Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm al-Nu'mānī, Akhbaranā Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad ibn Sa'īd, Qāla: Ḥaddathanā Yaḥyā ibn Zakarīyā ibn Shaybān, Qāla: Ḥaddathanā Yūsuf ibn Kulayb, Qāla: Ḥaddathanā al-Ḥasan ibn 'Alī ibn Abī Ḥamzah, 'an 'Āsim ibn Ḥumayd al-Ḥannāt, 'an Abī Ḥamzah al-Thumālī, Qāla: Sami'tu Abā Ja'far (AS) ... (Ḥillī, 2000 AD/1421 AH: 494; also cf. Nu'mānī, 1976 AD/1397 AH: 234)

4. Wa min Kitāb al-Ghaybah lil Nu'mānī: Akhbaranā Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad ibn Sa'īd ibn 'Uqdah, Qāla: Ḥaddathanā Muḥammad ibn al-Mufaḍḍal ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Qays ibn Rummānah al-Ash'arī wa Sa'dān ibn Ishāq ibn Sa'īd wa Aḥmad ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn 'Abd al-Malik al-Zayyāt wa Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad ibn al-Ḥusayn al-Qaṭawānī, 'an al-Ḥasan ibn Maḥbūb, 'an 'Amr ibn Thābit, 'an Jābir ibn Yazīd al-Ju'fī, Qāla: Sami'tu Abā Ja'far (AS)... (Ḥillī, 2000 AD/1421 AH: 496; also cf. Nu'mānī, 1976 AD/1397 AH: 331)

B) al-Ṣirāṭ al-Mustaqīm

In *al-Ṣirāṭ al-Mustaqīm* by 'Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn Yūnus Nabātī Bayyāḍī Baqā'ī (d. 877 AH), a part of one narration is cited from Nu'mānī's *al-Ghaybah*:

Wa Asnada Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm al-Nu'mānī fī Kitāb al-Ghaybah ilā al-Ṣādiq (AS)... ('Āmilī Nabātī, 1964 AD/1384 AH: 2, 263; also cf. Nu'mānī, 1976 AD/1397 AH: 331; Thalāth 'Ashrah Madīnata wa Ṭā'ifatun Yuḥāribu al-Qā'im...)

3-4-1. Summary

1. The total number of narrations (repeated and unrepeated) cited from *Muḥammad ibn Nu'mānī* in *Shī'ī* sources up to the 10th century is sixteen; of these, three narrations are not related to the issue of occultation; and one narration related to occultation is not found in the current extant manuscripts of Nu'mānī's *al-Ghaybah*.
2. All these narrations exist in these five sources "*al-Ghaybah (al-Ṭūsī)*, *Kanz al-Fawā'id*, *Faraj al-Mahmūm*, *Mahj al-Da'awāt*, *Mukhtaṣar al-Baṣṣā'ir*, *al-Ṣirāṭ al-Mustaqīm*" in four forms: 1) A narration cited

from Nu'mānī's *al-Ghaybah*; 2) A narration cited from Abū al-Ḥusayn Shujā'ī Kātib, which is not found in the current extant versions of *al-Ghaybah*; 3) A narration cited from Nu'mānī's *Dalā'il*; 4) Narrations cited from Nu'mānī himself, as an absolute narrator.

3. The names of the direct narrators from Nu'mānī in these Shi'a hadith sources are as follows:

1. Abū al-Ḥusayn Muḥammad ibn 'Alī al-Shujā'ī al-Kātib (Ṭūsī, 1990 AD/1411 AH: 127); or Abī al-Ḥasan Muḥammad ibn 'Alī al-Shujā'ī al-Kātib (Ṭūsī, 1990 AD/1411 AH: 257).
2. Abū al-Marjīyy Muḥammad ibn 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib al-Baladīyy (Karājaki, 1989 AD/1410 AH: 352).
3. 'Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn Yūsuf al-Ḥarrānī (Ibn Ṭāwūs, n.d.: 233).
4. Examining the hadith field and the lives of the authors who quoted Nu'mānī reveals that these writers belonged to the regions of Iraq and Syria. *Shaykh Ṭūsī* belonged to the Baghdad school of hadith and is buried in Najaf (cf. Tehrani, 2009 AD/1430 AH: 2, 161 and 162). *Karājaki*, a student of *Shaykh Ṭūsī* and from the same school of hadith, died in Najaf (cf. Karājaki, 2014 AD/1394 SH: 11). *Ibn Ṭāwūs*, with a time gap, was in the same hadith field and the region of Baghdad and Hillah (cf. Ibn Ṭāwūs, 1996 AD/1417 AH: 30). *Hasan ibn Sulaymān* and *Ali Nabāṭī* also both belonged to the Jabal Amel region and the Levant (cf. Tehrani, 2009 AD/1430 AH: 3, 41 and 89).
5. Apart from the codicological evidence of the manuscripts of the book *al-Ghaybah* (mentioned earlier), considering the geographical locations of Nu'mānī's limited narrators and the absence of

Nu'mānī's narrations in Shi'a sources outside the hadith field of Iraq and Syria, it seems that *Nu'mānī*'s works and narrations did not reach the hadith field of eastern Mesopotamia (i.e., the Iranian plateau and Khorasan) until the tenth century AH.

6. Given the small number of his narrations, it appears that even in Iraq and Syria, the narrations of *Muḥammad Nu'mānī* were not widely considered by scholars and authors of hadith works. This hypothesis is strengthened by the very few copies of *al-Ghaybah* in Iraq and the absence of any copies of this book in the Levant (cf. Ostadi, 2022 AD/1402 SH: A, entire text), even though the origin of the composition and copying of *al-Ghaybah* was the Levant (cf. Ostadi, 2020 AD/1400 SH: 29).

3-2. *Nu'mānī*'s Narrations and Narrators in *Ghulāt* of Sham Sources

In recent decades, a collection of *Ghulāt* texts, such as those of the Nusayris and Alawites of Sham, have been published and made available (e.g., Abū Mūsā, 2006: entire text). Given that *Nu'mānī* traveled to Sham and remained there until the end of his life (cf. Najāshī, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 383), and this life in Aleppo coincided with the golden age and rise to power of the Nusayri sect and similar sects during the reign of *Sayf al-Dawla* (333-356 AH) of the Hamdanid dynasty (e.g., Ghālib Ṭuwayl, 1966 AD/1386 AH: 259, 316, 318); therefore, it is necessary to consider the status of *Nu'mānī*'s narrators in these *Ghulāt* texts.

For example, by examining the available tradition and hadith
126 sources of the Nusayris, sources are found in which narrations from

Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm Nu'mānī are cited. To avoid lengthening the writing, and as an example, we will address one of the most important Nusayri sources containing numerous narrations from *Nu'mānī*:

3-2-1. *Nu'mānī's* Narrations in the Book *Ḥaqā'iq Asrār al-Dīn*

The hadith book *Ḥaqā'iq Asrār al-Dīn* is an ancient text from the Nusayri heritage; attributed among them to *Abū Muḥammad Ḥasan ibn Ali ibn Shu'ba Ḥarrānī* (4th century AH) (cf. Baqeri, 2015 AD/1394 SH: 163); and it includes many quotations from early *Ghulāt*, and clearly contains the special esoteric beliefs of the Nusayri *Ghulāt* such as: Metamorphosis, transmigration, the Lordship of the Proofs (*Ḥujaj*), permissiveness, and exaggeration (*Ghuluw*) (e.g., Abū Mūsā, 2006: 4, 78, 97, 139, 141, 157, 158, 164).

In the book *Ḥaqā'iq*, there are more than twenty-two narrations related to *Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm Nu'mānī*; the Isnads of most of them, in order of transmission, are as follows:

4. *Wa Ruwīya 'an Aḥmad ibn 'Alī 'an Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm 'an Ishāq Yarfa'uh ilā Muḥammad ibn Sinān fī Kitāb al-Tawḥīd 'an al-'Ālim Qāla...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 16).
5. *Wa Ḥaddathanī Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm 'an Abī 'Alī al-Baṣrī Qāla: Ḥaddathanī al-Rāzī 'an Abī al-Haytham 'an Hishām 'an al-Mufaḍḍal 'an Jābir Qāla: Su'ila Abū Ja'far minhu al-Salām 'an Tafsīr al-Ṣa'b al-Mustaṣ'ab Qāla...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 24).
6. *Ḥaddathanī Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm 'an Abī al-Baṣrī 'an Muḥammad ibn Mūsā 'an al-Karkhī 'an ibn Ṣadaqah 'an ibn Sinān Qāla: Qāla al-Ṣādiq...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 34).

7. *Wa Ḥaddathanī Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm ‘an al-Baṣrī ‘an al-Udsānī ‘an Muḥammad ibn Ja‘far al-Barsī ‘an al-Armanī ‘an Muḥammad ibn Sinān ‘an Yūnus ibn Zabīyān Qāla: Qāla al-Ṣādiq minhu al-Salām... (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 44).*
8. *Wa ‘anhu ‘an al-Baṣrī ‘an Muḥammad ibn Mūsā ‘an al-Karkhī ‘an Abī Samīnah ‘an Muḥammad ibn Sinān ‘an al-Mufaḍḍal Qāla: Qāla Sayyidī... (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 44).*
9. *Wa Ḥaddathanī Muḥammad ‘an al-Karkhī ‘an Ismā‘īl ‘an ibn Ṣadaqah Qāla: Qāla al-Riḍā... (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 44).*
10. *Wa Ḥaddathanī ‘an ‘Abdillāh ‘an Idrīs ‘an Zayd ‘an Yūnus Qāla: Qāla al-Ṣādiq minhu al-Salām... (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 44).*
11. *Wa Ḥaddathanī Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm ‘an al-Baṣrī ‘an ‘Abdillāh ibn al-‘Alā’ ‘an Idrīs ibn Ziyād ‘an Abī Sa‘īd ‘an ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn ‘an ibn Sinān Qāla: Qāla al-Ṣādiq minhu al-Salām... (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 67).*
12. *Wa Ḥaddathanī ‘anhu Qāla: Ḥaddathanī Muḥammad ibn Mūsā al-Karkhī ‘an Ismā‘īl ibn ‘Alī ‘an ibn Ṣadaqah ‘an Hāshim ‘an al-Mufaḍḍal Qāla: Qāla al-Ṣādiq minhu al-Salām... (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 67).*
13. *Wa Ḥaddathanī Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm ‘an Abī ‘Alī al-Baṣrī ‘an ‘Abdillāh ibn al-‘Alī ‘an Idrīs ‘an Zayd ibn Ṭalḥah ‘an al-Mufaḍḍal ibn ‘Umar Qāla: Qāla Sayyidī Abū ‘Abdillāh minhu al-Salām... (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 83).*
14. *Wa bil Isnād ‘an Zayd ibn Ṭalḥah ‘an ‘Alī ibn ‘Abd al-Malik ‘an al-Mufaḍḍal ibn ‘Umar Qāla: Qāla Sayyidī... (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 83).*
15. *Wa bil Isnād ‘an ‘Abdillāh ‘an Idrīs al-Kafartūthī ‘an ibn Sinān Qāla: Su‘ila al-Ṣādiq minhu al-Salām ‘an Kalāmihim Faqāla...*

(Ḥarrānī, 2016: 83).

16. *Wa Ḥaddathanī Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm 'an Abī 'Alī al-Baṣrī 'an Abī Muḥammad al-Hamdānī 'an Abī Sa'īd 'an Muḥammad ibn Mūsā 'an 'Alī ibn al-Ḥasan 'an Muḥammad ibn Sinān Qāla: Kāna al-Mufaḍḍal wa Jamā'ah min Aṣḥābih fī Ghurfati Muḥjami 'in Yashrabūn wa Yatadhākarūn idh Habaṭ al-Sayyid min al-Saqf wa Biyadihi Bāqah Ādharyūn fa Qāla lahum...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 128).

17. *Wa Ḥaddathanī Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm 'an Abī 'Alī 'an Muḥammad ibn Mūsā wa 'Abdillāh ibn Sinān wa Zayd ibn Ṭalḥah 'an al-Mufaḍḍal 'an Jābir wa Abī Ḥamzah Qālū Jamī'ān Qāla al-Ālim...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 141).

18. *Ḥaddathanī 'anhu 'an Muḥammad 'an al-Karkhī 'an Abī Samīnah wa 'Abd al-Raḥmān wa 'an ibn Sinān 'an al-Ṣādiq minhu al-Salām Qāla...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 141).

19. *Wa bil Isnād 'an al-Karkhī 'an Abī Hāshim 'an Hishām 'an al-Mufaḍḍal Qāla: Qāla Sayyidī...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 142).

20. *Ḥaddathanī Abū 'Abdillāh Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm 'an Abī Baṣīr Qāla: Ḥaddathanī Muḥammad ibn Mūsā 'an ibn Mahrān 'an Abī Samīnah 'an al-Mufaḍḍal Qāla: Jā'a Samā'ah ilā al-Bāqir minhu al-Salām Qāla lahu...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 146).

21. *Wa ḥaddathanī Ayḍan 'anhu Qāla: Ḥaddathanī Ḥamzah ibn al-Qāsim 'an al-Rabī' Qāla: Qāla al-Sayyid Muḥammad (PBUH)...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 147).

22. *Ḥaddathanī Abū 'Abdillāh 'an 'Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn Mūsā 'an al-Karkhī 'an Muḥammad ibn Sinān 'an Sharīk al-Faḍl 'an al-* **129**

Mufaḍḍal Qāla: Qultu li Sayyidī: Kayfa Na‘lam Ḥālu man La‘antumūh fa Kānat ‘alayh Sakhta? Qāla... (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 148).

23. *Ḥaddathanī Abū ‘Abdillāh Muḥammad ibn [Ibrāhīm] ‘Alī al-Baṣrī Qāla: Ḥaddathanī Muḥammad ibn Mūsā ‘an al-Karkhī ‘an Abī Samīnah ‘an Muḥammad ibn Sinān Qāla: Qāla al-Ṣādiq minhu al-Salām...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 152).

24. *Wa Ḥaddathanī Ayḍan ‘anhu ‘an ‘Abdillāh ibn al-‘Alā’ ‘an Idrīs ibn Ziyād ‘an Zayd ibn Ṭalḥah ‘an al-Mufaḍḍal Qāla: Qāla al-Ṣādiq minhu al-Salām...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 152).

25. *Wa bil Isnād ‘an Zayd ibn Ṭalḥah ‘an Abī ‘Alī ibn ‘Abd al-Malik ‘an Sharīk ‘an al-Mufaḍḍal Qāla: Qāla al-Ṣādiq minhu al-Salām...* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 152).

3-2-2. Analysis and Summary of the Narrations in Ḥaqā’iq Asrār al-Dīn

The narrations of *Nu‘mānī* in *Ḥaqā’iq Asrār al-Dīn* can be examined and analyzed from at least several aspects: "Isnads, narrators, and subject matter."

3-2-2-1. Isnads of *Nu‘mānī*'s Narrations in *Ḥaqā’iq*

1. *Nu‘mānī*'s name is not consistent in all the isnads of the book *Ḥaqā’iq*; the most frequent attribution is "*Muḥammad ibn Ibrahīm*." Three instances use "*Abū ‘Abdullāh Muḥammad ibn*," omitting the word *Ibrāhīm*; two of these three are counted with additional and elevated isnads. Of all the isnads mentioned previously, one narration's isnad is attributed to "*Abū ‘Abdullāh*," which is unclear whether it refers to *Abū ‘Abdullāh Khaṣīb*, *Ḥafṣ*, or *Abū ‘Abdullāh Nu‘mānī*; based on similar isnads and comparison with other

narrators, it seems that *Muḥammad Nu'mānī* is intended.

2. Of the 22 narrations of *Nu'mānī* in *Ḥaqā'iq* (disregarding minor variations in transmission paths), approximately 18 narrations are transmitted through two chains: "*Muḥammad ibn Mihrān al-Karkhī from Muḥammad ibn Mūsā*" and "*Idrīs ibn Zīyād al-Kafartūthī 'an 'Abdullāh ibn al-'Alā*," both ultimately from "*Abū 'Alī al-Baṣrī*." Only one isnad of a third narration lists the narrator as "*Abī al-Baṣrī*," omitting "*Alī*."

3. None of the twenty-two narrations of *Nu'mānī* in *Ḥaqā'iq* were found in Shi'a or Sunni sources. Only a portion of narration number 11 of *Nu'mānī* in *Ḥaqā'iq* (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 83) exists in a part of a narration by *Shaykh Ṣadūq* in *Ma'ānī al-Akḥbār* as follows:

Ḥaddathanā Ja'far ibn Muḥammad ibn Masrūr 'anhu Qāla Ḥaddathanā al-Ḥusayn ibn Muḥammad ibn 'Āmir 'an 'Ammihī 'Abdillāh ibn 'Āmir 'an Muḥammad ibn Abī 'Umayr 'an Ibrāhīm al-Karkhī 'an Abī 'Abdillāh (AS) annahu Qāla: "If you fully understand one hadith, it is more valuable than a thousand narrations you repeat parrot-like; and none of you will be a jurist unless he understands the ambiguities of our speech. Truly, each sentence of our speech can be interpreted in seventy ways, and the way out of each is open to us."¹ (Ṣadūq, 1959 AD/1379 AH: 1, 2)

1. The original text is: "Ḥadīthun Tadrīhī Khayrun min Alfī Ḥadīthin Tarwīhī wa lā Yakūnu al-Rajulu minkum Faqīhan ḥattā Ya'rifa Ma'ārīḍa Kalāmīnā wa inna al-Kalimata min Kalāmīnā li Tanṣarifu 'alā Sab'īna Wajhan lanā min Jamī'ihā al-Makhrāja."

4. The chains of narration in *Nu'mānī's Ḥaqā'iq* exhibit weaknesses in many instances, which become clearer when all the chains are examined together. However, some of these chains have unclear weaknesses, such as: "And he also narrated to me from him, saying: *Ḥamza ibn al-Qāsim* narrated to me from *al-Rabī'* saying..." (Ḥarrānī, 2016: 147)

5. All the narrations in *Ḥaqā'iq* are directly attributed to *Nu'mānī*, except for one narration which is from *Aḥmad ibn 'Alī*, from *Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm*, from *Ishāq*. Apparently, this is *Abū al-'Abbās Aḥmad ibn 'Alī al-Rāzī al-Khaḍīb al-Ayady*; the scholars of Rijāl (men of Hadith) considered him weak and an extremist (cf. Najāshī, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 97; Ibn Ghadā'irī, 2001 AD/1422 AH: 43; Amīn 'Āmilī, 2000 AD/1421 AH: 4, 349). For example, Najāshī wrote: "Our companions said: He was not like that, and it was said: He had extremism and arrogance, and he has the book *al-Shifā' wal Jalā'* in *al-Ghaybah*..." (Najāshī, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 97)

Some also mentioned his name among those known for extremism (Esfandiari, 1995 AD/1374 SH: 206).

Therefore, the narrators of these narrations of *Nu'mānī* are two individuals:

- 1) *Ḥasan ibn 'Alī ibn Shu'ba Ḥarrānī*
- 2) *Abul 'Abbās Aḥmad ibn 'Alī al-Rāzī*

To better understand the five points mentioned above, and to observe some of the weaknesses in the chains of narration of

132 *Nu'mānī's Ḥaqā'iq*, a table of these chains is included.

Table of Nu'mānī's narrations in Ḥaqā'iq Asrār al-Dīn

	350 AH	325 AH	300 AH	275 AH	250 AH	225 AH	200 AH	175 AH	150 AH	125 AH
1	Muhammad ibn Ibrahim			Ishāq (d.286)	?	?	Muhammad ibn Sinān (d.220)		al-'Ālim	---
2	Muhammad ibn Ibrahim	Abī 'Alī al-Baṣrī		al-Rāzī	Abī al-Haytham		Hishām	al-Mufaḍḍal (d. around 185)	Jābir	Abū Ja'far
3	Muhammad ibn Ibrahim	Abī al-Baṣrī	Muhammad ibn Mūsā	al-Karkhī		Ibn Sadaqa	Ibn Sinān			al-Sādiq
4	Muhammad ibn Ibrahim	al-Baṣrī		al-'Udasā'ī	Muhammad ibn Ja'far al-Barsī	al-Armanī	Muhammad ibn Sinān (d.220)	Yūnus ibn Zabyān		Al-Sādiq (d. 148)
5	Wa 'anhu	al-Baṣrī	Muhammad ibn Mūsā	al-Karkhī	Abī Samīna		Muhammad ibn Sinān (d.220)	Al-Mufaḍḍal (d. around 185)		Sayyidī
6	Muhammad			al-Karkhī	Ismā'il	Ibn Sadaqa			Al-Riḍā	
7	'anhu		'Abdullāh	Idrīs		Zayd		Yūnus		Al-Sādiq
8	Muhammad ibn Ibrahim	al-Baṣrī	'Abdullāh ibn al-'Alā'	Idrīs ibn Ziyād	Abī Sa'id	'Alī ibn al-Husayn	Ibn Sinān			Al-Sādiq
9			Muhammad ibn Mūsā	al-Karkhī	Ismā'il ibn 'Alī	Ibn Sadaqa	Hāshim	Al-Mufaḍḍal		Al-Sādiq
10	Muhammad ibn Ibrahim	Abī 'Alī al-Baṣrī	'Abdullāh ibn al-'Alī	Idrīs		Zayd ibn Talḥah		Al-Mufaḍḍal ibn 'Umar		Sayyidī
11	Wa bil Isnād	Wa bil Isnād	Wa bil Isnād	Wa bil Isnād	Wa bil Isnād	Zayd ibn Talḥah	'Alī ibn 'Abd al-Malik	Al-Mufaḍḍal ibn 'Umar		Sayyidī
12	Wa bil Isnād	Wa bil Isnād	'Abdullāh	Idrīs al-Kafartūthī			Ibn Sinān			Al-Sādiq
13	Muhammad ibn Ibrahim	Abī 'Alī al-Baṣrī	Abī Muhammad al-Hamdānī	Abī Sa'id	Muhammad ibn Mūsā	'Alī ibn al-Hasan	Muhammad ibn Sinān			al-Sayyid
14	Muhammad ibn Ibrahim	Abī 'Alī	Muhammad ibn Mūsā and 'Abdullāh ibn Sanān			Wazīd ibn Talḥah		Al-Mufaḍḍal	Jābir and Abī Hamzah	Al-'Ālim
15	'anhu		Muhammad	Al-Karkhī	Abī Samīnah and 'Abd al-Rahmān		Ibn Sanān			Al-Sādiq
16	Wa bil Isnād	Wa bil Isnād	Wa bil Isnād	Al-Karkhī	Abī Hāshim		Hishām	Al-Mufaḍḍal		Sayyidī
17	Abū 'Abdillāh Muhammad ibn Ibrahim Ḥaddathani Ayydan	Abī Baṣrī	Muhammad ibn Mūsā	Ibn Mūhrān	Abī Samīnah			Al-Mufaḍḍal		Al-Bāqir
18		'anhu			Hamza ibn al-Qāsim		Al-Rabī'			Al-Sayyid Muhammad (PBUH)
19	Abū 'Abdillāh	Ali	Muhammad ibn Mūsā	Al-Karkhī			Muhammad ibn Sinān	Sharīk al-Faḍl 'an al-Mufaḍḍal		Sayyidī
20	Abū 'Abdillāh Muhammad ibn Ibrahim	Ali al-Baṣrī	Muhammad ibn Mūsā	Al-Karkhī	Abī Samīna		Muhammad ibn Sinān			Al-Sādiq
21	Wa Ḥaddathani Ayydan	'anhu	'Abdullāh ibn al-'Alā'	Idrīs ibn Ziyād		Zayd ibn Talḥah		Al-Mufaḍḍal		Al-Sādiq
22	Wa bil Isnād	Wa bil Isnād	Wa bil Isnād	Wa bil Isnād	Wa bil Isnād	Zayd ibn Talḥah	Abī 'Alī ibn 'Abd al-Malik	Sharīk 'an al-Mufaḍḍal		Al-Sādiq

3-2-2-2. Isnad Narrators

By summarizing 22 chains of narration of *Nu'mānī*, it becomes clear that approximately 17 narrations have similar chains in two ways: the *Karrkhī* and *Idrīs* routes. On the other hand, all of *Nu'mānī*'s narrations are narrated from someone named "*Abū 'Alī al-Baṣrī*"; who may be *Abū Ali Muḥammad ibn Hammām* (d. 336 AH) known as the

scribe and teacher of *Muhammad Nu'mānī*, or *Abū Ali Muhammad ibn Hammām* (d. 306 AH).

Also, the chains of five other narrations are either different from the two routes above or are corrupted and have scribal errors. A table summarizing the chains of narration of *Nu'mānī* in *Ḥaqā'iq* is as follows:

	+350 AH	+325 AH	+300 AH	+275 AH	+250 AH	+225 AH	+200 AH	+175 AH	
9	Muhammad ibn Ibrāhīm al-Nu'mānī	Abī 'Alī al-Baṣrī	Muhammad ibn Mūsā	Muhammad ibn Mihrān al-Karkhī	Abī Samīnah Muhammad ibn Ali Širāfī Ismā'īl ibn Ali Abī Hāshim	?	Hishām / Hāshim	Al-Mufaḍḍal (d. around 185)	Imam Bāqir, Šādiq, Riḍā (AS)
8	Muhammad ibn Ibrāhīm	Abī 'Alī al-Baṣrī	'Abdullāh ibn al-'Alā'	Idrīs ibn Ziyād al-Kafartūthī	Abī Sa'id	Ali ibn al-Husayn	Muhammad ibn Sinān (d.220)	Yūnus ibn Zabyān	al-Šādiq (AS)
					?	Zayd ibn Talḥa	Abī Ali ibn 'Abdul Malik	Al-Mufaḍḍal (d. around 185)	
1	Muhammad ibn Ibrāhīm	Abī 'Alī al-Baṣrī	Muhammad ibn Mūsā and 'Abdullāh ibn Sinān			Wazīd ibn Talḥa		Al-Mufaḍḍal 'an Jābir wa Abī Hamza	Al-'Ālim
1	Muhammad ibn Ibrāhīm	Abī 'Alī al-Baṣrī		Ishāq (d.286)	?		Muhammad ibn Sinān (d.220)		Al-'Ālim
1	Muhammad ibn Ibrāhīm	Abī 'Alī al-Baṣrī	Al-Rāzī	Abī al-Haytham			Hishām 'an al-Mufaḍḍal (d. around 185)	Al-Mufaḍḍal 'an Jābir (ibn Yazīd al-Ju'fī)	Abū Ja'far
1	Muhammad ibn Ibrāhīm	Abī 'Alī al-Baṣrī	Al-'Udsānī	Muhammad ibn Ja'far al-Barsī	(Muhammad ibn Yahyā) al-Armanīy		Muhammad ibn Sinān (d. 220)	Yūnus ibn Zabyān	al-Šādiq (AS)
1	Haaddathanī Ayḍan	'anhu			Hamza ibn al-Qāsim		Al-Rabī'		Al-Sayyid Muhammad (PBUH)

In the documents of these narrations, apart from *Nu'mānī* and *Abū Ali al-Baṣrī*, we encounter these names: *Muhammad ibn Mūsā al-Sammān*, *'Abdullāh ibn al-'Alā' al-Madhārī*, *'Abdullāh ibn Sinān*, *al-Rāzī*, *al-Adasani*, *Muhammad ibn Mihrān al-Karkhī*, *Idrīs ibn Ziyād al-Kafartūthī*, *Ishāq*, *Abū al-Haytham*, *Muhammad ibn Ja'far al-Barsī*, *Hamza ibn al-Qāsim*, *Abī Samīna Muhammad ibn Ali Širāfī*,

Ismā'īl ibn Ali, Abī Hāshim, Abī Sa'īd, Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā al-Armanī, al-Rabī', ibn Ṣadqa, Ali ibn al-Ḥusayn, Zayd ibn Ṭalḥa, Hishām/ Hāshim, Muḥammad ibn Sinān, (Abī) Ali ibn 'Abdul Malik, al-Mufaḍḍal, Yūnus ibn Ṣabyān, Jābir, Abī Ḥamza.

Most of these individuals are among the disreputable narrators, or leaders of the *Ghulāt* (extremists) and Nusayris, or those sympathetic to the legacy of the *Ghulāt* and their hadith circles. A few are individuals whose names and biographies are not found in Rijālī books, and these narrators are likely fabrications of the intellectual and practical tradition of the Shi'a *Ghulāt*; they have been disregarded by the experts in the field of *Rijāl* and hadith scholars of the Mesopotamian schools of hadith.

Importantly, the three primary narrators of these traditions who directly narrated from the impeccable Imams (AS) or someone close to him—namely, *Muḥammad ibn Sinān, Yūnus ibn Ṣabyān, and Mufaḍḍal al-Ju'fī*—were narrators who were highly regarded by the *Ghulāt*; and among the experts in the field of *Rijāl*, significant disputes regarding their *Ghulātīc* biographies are evident (cf. Shamshiri, 2018 AD/1398 SH: entire text; Ḥillī, 1891 AD/1311 AH: 412; Khu'ī, 1992 AD/1413 AH: 17, 169).

For example, *Yūnus ibn Ṣabyān al-Kūfī* can be cited. *Najāshī* considers him extremely weak and regards all his books as fabricated (cf. Najāshī, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 448). *Ibn Ghadā'irī* considers him a Ghali, liar, and fabricator of hadith (Ibn Ghadā'irī, 2001 AD/1422 AH: 101). *Kashshī* quotes Imam *Kāẓim* (AS) as having cursed him thousands of times (Kashshī, 1988 AD/1409 AH: 2, 275). The experts in the field of

Rijāl collectively describe him as a "Liar, weak, fabricator, and forger of hadith." (cf. Māmaqānī, 1990 AD/1369 SH: 269)

Apart from these three well-known individuals, for the sake of brevity, we will now only consider the biographical status of some of the narrators of *Nu'mānī's* narrations in *Ḥaqā'iq*:

1. Abū Ja'far Muḥammad ibn Mūsā ibn 'Īsā al-Hamdānī al-Sammān

Najāshī reports that the people of Qom weakened his authority due to his extremism (*Ghuluw*); *Ibn Walīd* also stated that he fabricated hadiths (cf. Najāshī, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 338). Shi'a scholars of *Rijāl* generally consider him a weak narrator, accused of extremism, fabrication of hadiths, and unsound principles (cf. Māmaqānī, 1990 AD/1369 SH: 269).

2. Muḥammad ibn 'Abdullāh ibn Mihrān al-Karkhī

He is a well-known figure among the extremist (*Ghulāt*) Shi'a, and he was particularly noted in the traditions of the Nasiri extremists (for example, cf. Khaṣībī, 1990 AD/1411 AH: 76, 187, 286-287, 362). *Najāshī* said of him: "He is from among the non-Arabs, an extremist, liar, and corrupt in religion and hadith, and this is well-known." (cf. Najāshī, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 350) *Ibn Ghadā'irī* also called him "An extremist, weak, and liar." (cf. Ibn Ghadā'irī, 2001 AD/1422 AH: 95) *Ṭūsī*, following his predecessors, also considered him weak and wrote: "He is accused of extremism (*Ghuluw*).\" (cf. Ṭūsī, 1994 AD/1415 AH: 391)

3. Abul Faḍl Idrīs ibn Zayd ibn 'Alī Kafarthūthī (Kafartūthī)

136 *Ibn Ghadā'irī* expressed doubt about his narrations, writing that he

narrated from among the weak (cf. Ibn Ghadā'irī, 2001 AD/1422 AH: 39). Some also consider him a Waqifī (cf. Shūshtarī, 1989 AD/1410 AH: 1, 697). Evidence of his extremism (Ghuluw) also exists (for example, cf. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, 1959 AD/1379 AH: 4, 428).

4. Ishāq ibn Muḥammad Aḥmar Nakha'ī

He was an extremist and the leader of the *Ishāqiyya* sect (for example, cf. Ziraklī, 1980: 1, 295; Ghālib Ṭuwayl, 1966 AD/1386 AH: 209-211), and was among the teachers of *Ibn Hammām* (apparently *Abū Ali Baṣrī*). *Najāshī* and *Hillī* called him "A mine of mixing" (Ma'dīn Takhlīt) (cf. Najāshī, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 73). *Ibn Ghadā'irī* considers him corrupt in religion, a liar, and a fabricator of hadiths, saying: "Do not pay attention to what he narrated, and do not elevate his hadiths." (cf. Ibn Ghadā'irī, 2001 AD/1422 AH: 41) Scholars of *Rijāl* generally consider him "Corrupt in religion, a liar, a fabricator of hadiths, and essentially a mine of mixing." (cf. Māmaqānī, 1990 AD/1369 SH: 266)

5. Muḥammad ibn Ja'far al-Barṣī

He is among the narrators of the traditions of the *Ghulāt* (extremists) (cf. Khaṣībī, 1990 AD/1411 AH: 226). He also has numerous narrations from *Muḥammad al-Armanī*, a leader of the Nasīriyah (cf. Zayyāt Nīshābūrī, n.d.: 29, 30, 39, 52, 60, 69, 79, 94, 105, 113, 132, 135, 137, and 138). Even the well-known extremist narration, "*Khabar al-Khayt*," is attributed to him (cf. Ansari, 2007 AD/1386 SH: 5).

6. Abū Samīnah Muḥammad ibn 'Alī Šīrafi

Najāshī considers him "Extremely weak, corrupt in belief, unreliable" **137**

in anything, known for lying... then known for extremism." (cf. Najāshī, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 332) *Ibn Ghadā'irī* wrote: "A liar, extremist, he entered Qum and his matter became known there, and *Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad ibn 'Isā al-Ash'arī* – may God have mercy on him – expelled him, and he was famous for his extremism, and his hadith was not considered or recorded." (cf. *Ibn Ghadā'irī*, 2001 AD/1422 AH: 94) *Ṭūsī*, with explanations, also considered him an extremist (*Ṭūsī*, 1996 AD/1417 AH: 223).

7. Ismā'īl ibn 'Alī Khuzā'i

Najāshī and *Ṭūsī* consider him unreliable (cf. *Najāshī*, 1986 AD/1407 AH: 32). *Ibn Ghadā'irī* considers him a liar and fabricator of hadith (cf. *Ibn Ghadā'irī*, 2001 AD/1422 AH: 42). *Ṭūsī* also says that he does not narrate hadith from the Imams (AS). (cf. *Ṭūsī*, 1994 AD/1415 AH: 469). In summary, the scholars of *Rijāl* consider him a "Liar, fabricator of hadith, unreliable in hadith." (cf. *Māmaqānī*, 1990 AD/1369 SH: 266).

8. Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā al-Armanī

He is not known in the Shi'a sources on *Rijāl*. He has narrations in *Ṭib al-A'immaḥ* from the legacy of the Ghulāt, as mentioned earlier (cf. *Zayyāt Nīshābūrī*, n.d.: 29-138). According to a narration in the same book, *Muḥammad* is considered a "Bāb" (leader): "*Muḥammad ibn Ja'far ibn 'Alī al-Barṣī* said: He narrated to us *Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā al-Armanī*, and he was a Bāb for *Mufaḍḍal ibn 'Umar*, and *Mufaḍḍal* was a Bāb for *Abū 'Abd Allāh al-Ṣādiq* (AS)." (*Zayyāt Nīshābūrī*, n.d.: 128) The meaning of "Bāb" clearly indicates his affiliation with the extremist

138 traditions of the Nasīrīyah (cf. *Ansari*, 2007 AD/1386 SH: 5).

9. 'Abbās ibn Ṣadaqah

Kashshī narrates two traditions from *al-Faḍl ibn Shādhān* and *Naṣr ibn al-Ṣabbāh*, in which 'Abbās ibn Ṣadaqah is mentioned as one of the "Great cursed extremists" (cf. *Kashshī*, 1988 AD/1409 AH: 1, 522); later scholars of *Rijāl* also reflect the same in their works and write: "From the great cursed extremists, and he preceded in the leadership of a group." (For example, cf. *Khuṭī*, 1992 AD/1413 AH: 246)

3-2-3. Summarizing the Relationship between Nu'mānī, *Ḥaqā'iq Asrār al-Dīn*, and the *Ghulāt*

1. The book *Ḥaqā'iq* is a book in the *Ghulāt* tradition; and even from the narrators of Nu'mānī's narrations, this point is clearly evident in this book.
2. Due to the extensive use by the author of *Ḥaqā'iq* of Nu'mānī's narrations and other evidence such as the narrators of Nu'mānī's chains of transmission, it appears that Nu'mānī's connection with the *Ghulāt*, and specifically the Nasiriyyah *Ghulāt* of the Sham region was strong; and conversely, Nu'mānī's narrations were given attention by them.
3. Given the extensive use by Muḥammad Nu'mānī of the works and narrators of earlier *Ghulāt* in this book, it can be concluded that Nu'mānī paid attention to the tradition of the earlier *Ghulāt*; and he had no qualms about utilizing these works and narrators. Even some of these *Ghulāt* narrators appear in the chains of transmission of his narrations in al-Ghaybah (for example, cf. Nu'mānī, 1977 AD/1397 AH: 111, 276, 285, 326).

Conclusion

1. After examining all available Shi'a hadith sources, it became clear that there are no significant narrations or hadiths quoted from *Nu'mānī* or his books in Shi'a sources; and until the tenth century, only sixteen narrations (repeated and unrepeated) exist in a few sources from the 5th, 7th, 8th, and 9th centuries. The names of the direct narrators of these narrations are: *Muḥammad al-Shujā'ī*, *Muḥammad al-Baladīyy*, *Ali al-Harrānī*.
2. By examining the hadith field and the lives of the authors who quoted *Nu'mānī*, it becomes clear that these authors belonged to the regions of Iraq and Sham; and essentially, *Nu'mānī*'s narrations did not reach the hadith field of eastern Mesopotamia until the tenth century. Also, given the small number of narrations quoted by the authors of Iraq and Sham, it appears that *Nu'mānī*'s narrations were not given much attention by the scholars and authors of hadith works in Iraq and Sham.
3. Examination of the available Nusayri hadith heritage reveals sources containing narrations attributed to *Muḥammad al-Nu'mānī*. For example, the book *Ḥaqā'iq Asrār al-Dīn*, attributed to *Abū Muḥammad Ḥasan ibn Ali ibn Shu'bah Harrānī* (4th century) was examined. This work includes numerous quotations from early *Ghulāt* (extremists), and explicitly contains the distinctive esoteric beliefs of Nusayri *Ghulāt*, such as metamorphosis (*Maskh*), transmigration (*Tanāsukh*), the Lordship of the Proofs (*Rubūbīyyat Hujaj*), permissiveness (*Ibāḥah*), and exaggeration (*Ghuluw*). In

Ḥaqā'iq, there are more than twenty-two narrations related to *Muḥammad ibn Ibrahim Nu'mānī*. Disregarding a few narrations with minor variations in transmission, approximately eighteen narrations are transmitted through two chains: "*Muḥammad ibn Mihrān al-Karkhī* from *Muḥammad ibn Mūsā*" and "*Idrīs ibn Zīyād al-Kafartūthī* from '*Abdullāh ibn al-'Alā*'," both ultimately tracing back to "*Abī Ali al-Baṣrī*." None of these Nu'mānī narrations were found in either Shi'a or Sunni sources.

4. All the narrations in *Ḥaqā'iq* from *Nu'mānī* are directly attributed to him, except for one narration which is transmitted through Ahmad ibn Ali from Muḥammad ibn Ibrahim from *Ishāq*. Therefore, the narrators of these *Nu'mānī* narrations ultimately end with these two individuals: *Ḥasan ibn Shu'bah Harrānī* and *Aḥmad ibn Ali al-Rāzī*.
5. Based on the chains of narration in *Ḥaqā'iq*, *Nu'mānī* narrated his traditions from someone named "*Abī Ali al-Baṣrī*," who may be either *Abū Ali Muḥammad ibn Hammām* (d. 336 AH), known as the scribe and teacher of *Muḥammad Nu'mānī*, or *Abū Ali Aḥmad ibn Hammām* (d. 306 AH). Furthermore, summarizing the twenty-two chains of narration from *Nu'mānī* reveals that approximately seventeen narrations share similar chains through the *Karkhī* and *Idrīs* routes. Moreover, the majority of the narrators in the chains of *Nu'mānī*'s narrations are disreputable narrators, leaders among the Nusayri *Ghulāt*, or those sympathetic to the *Ghulāt* heritage and their hadith circles.
6. From the extensive use of other facts and evidence by the author, it becomes clear that *Nu'mānī*'s connection with the *Ghulāt* of the

Nusayriyah in the Levant region was strong; and conversely, Numayni's narrations were highly regarded by them. Furthermore, given *Nu'mānī's* extensive use of the works and narrators of early *Ghulāt* in this book, it can be concluded that *Nu'mānī* paid attention to the tradition of the early *Ghulāt*; and he had no qualms about utilizing these works and narrators.

Sources

- Ibn Shahr Āshūb, M. (1959 AD/1379 AH). *Manāqib Āl Abī Ṭālib*. Qom: Allamah.
- Ibn Ṭāwūs, A. (1948 AD/1368 AH). *Faraj al-Mahmūm fī Tārīkh 'Ulamā' al-Nujūm*. Qom: Dar al-Dhakha'ir.
- Ibn Ṭāwūs, A. (1996 AD/1417 AH). *Kashf al-Mahja li Thamaratil Muhja*. Qom: Maktab al-I'lam al-Islami.
- Ibn Ṭāwūs, A. (n.d.). *Muhaj al-Da'awāt*. Qom: N.n.
- Ibn Ghada'irī, A. (2001 AD/1422 AH). *Rijāl Ibn al-Ghada'irī*. (Husayni Jalali, Ed). Qom: Dar al-Hadith.
- Abū Mūsā and Shaykh Mūsā. (2006). *Silsilah al-Turāth al-'Alawī*. Diyar Muqal: Dar li Ajl al-Ma'rifa.
- Ostadi, R. (1990 AD/1369 SH). "A Book with Four Titles." *Kayhan Andishe*. No. 33.
- Ostadi, K. (2021 AD/1400 SH). "Introduction and Study of the Oldest Manuscript of al-Ghayba Attributed to Nu'mānī." *Intizar Maw'ud*. Vol. 21, no. 75, pp. 75-109.
- Ostadi, K. (2022 AD/1402 SH (a)). "Introduction to the Manuscripts of the Book al-Ghayba by Nu'mānī." *Mahdavi Researches*. Vol. 12,

- no. 45, pp. 97-134.
- Ostadi, K. (2022 AD/1402 SH (b)). "Introduction and Analysis of the Manuscripts of the Book al-Ghayba Attributed to Nu'mānī." *Manuscript Studies Research Journal*. Vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 189-208.
- Esfandiary, A. (1995 AD/1374 SH). "A Research on the Ghulāt Tribes. Tehran: Publications of the Islamic Propaganda Organization.
- Amīn 'Āmilī, M. (2000 AD/1421 AH). *A'yān al-Shī'a*. Beirut: Dar al-Ta'aruf.
- Ansari, H. (2007 AD/1386 SH). "The Legacy of the Ghulāt: From Abū al-Qāsim al-Kūfī to the Author of 'Uyūn al-Mu'jizāt." *Historical reviews site*. October.
- Baqeri, H. (2015 AD/1394 SH). "Ḥaqā'iq Asrār al-Dīn, an Ancient Text from the Nasirean Heritage: A Study in Dating and Identifying the Author of the Article." *Religions and Mysticism*. Vol. 48, no. 2, pp. 163-183.
- Tehrani (Āqā Buzurg), M. (1987 AD/1408 AH). *al-Dharī'ah ilā Taṣānīf al-Shī'ah*. Qom: Ismailiyan Institute.
16. Tehrani (Āqā Buzurg), M. (2009 AD/1430 AH). *Ṭabaqāt A'lām al-Shī'ah*. Beirut: Dar Ihya' al-Turath al-'Arabi.
- Ḥarrānī, H. (2016). *Ḥaqā'iq Asrār al-Dīn*. (Yunus Hasan, H. Ed). N.p.: Online Digital Publication.
- Ḥillī, H. (2000 AD/1421 AH). *Mukhtaṣar al-Baṣā'ir*. Qom: Islamic Publication Institute.
- Ḥillī, H. (1891 AH/1311 AH). *Khulāṣat al-Aqwāl*. Tehran: N.n.
- Khaṣṣībī, H. (1990 AD/1411 AH). *al-Hidāyah al-Kubrā*. Beirut: Al-Balag.

- Khu'ī, A. (1992 AD/1413 AH). *Mu'jam Rijāl al-Hadith*. N.p.: Ayatollah Khu'i Institute Publication.
- Derayati, M. (2012 AD/1391 SH). *Catalogue of Iranian Manuscripts*. Tehran: National Library.
- Ziraklī, Kh. (1980). *al-A 'lām*. Beirut: Dar al-'Ilm lil-Malayin.
- Zayyāt Nīshābūrī, I. (n.d.). *Ṭib al-A 'immah*. Qom: Sharif Radi.
- Shubayrī Zanjānī, M. (2001 AD/1380 SH). "Nu'mānī and Ghaybah Sources (1)." *Intizar-e Maw'ud*. No. 2.
- Shubayrī Zanjānī, M. (2006 AD/1385 SH). "Nu'mānī and Ghaybah Sources (10)." *Intizar-e Maw'ud*. No. 18.
- Shamshīrī, R. (2018 AD/1398 SH). "The Grounds for Weakening Yūnus ibn Zabyān." *Quran and Hadith Sciences*. Vol. 51, no. 2. Serial No. 103, pp. 153-172.
- Shūshtarī, M. (1989 AD/1410 AH). *Qāmūs al-Rijāl*. Qom: Islamic Publication Institute.
- Şadūq, M. (1959 AD/1379 AH). *Ma 'ānī al-Akhhbār*. Qom: Society of Seminary Teachers.
- Ṭūsī, M. (1990 AD/1411 AH). *al-Ghaybah*. (ʿIbādullāh and Nāşī, Res). Qom: Dar al-Ma'arif al-Islamiyyah.
- Ṭūsī, M. (1994 AD/1415 AH). *Rijāl Ṭūsī*. (al-Isfahani, Ed). Qom: Society of Seminary Teachers.
- Ṭūsī, M. (1996 AD/1417 AH). *al-Fihrist*. (al-Qayyumi, J. Ed). Qom: N.n.
- ʿĀmilī Nabāţī, A. (1964 AD/1384 AH). *al-Şirāţ al-Mustaqīm ilā Mustahiqqī*. (Behbudi, M. B. Intro). Tehran: Maktabat al-Murtadaviyyah.

- ‘Iṣmat al-Dawlah, M. (2016). *al-Risālah al-Miṣrīyyah (Manhaj al-‘Ilm wal Bayān wa Nazhat al-Sam‘ wal Bayān)*. (Baghdadi Qatī'i, A. App). N.p.: Al-Majmu'ah al-Kamilah.
- Ghālib Ṭuwayl, M. (1966 AD/1386 AH). *Tārīkh al-‘Alawīyīn*. Beirut: Dar al-Andalus.
- ‘Alam al-Hudā, A. (2010 AD/1389 SH). *Risālah al-Muḥkam wa al-Mutashābih*. Mashhad: Islamic Research Foundation.
- ‘Alam al-Hudā, A. (1984 AD/1405 AH). *Rasā'il al-Sharīf al-Murtaḍā*. (Rajayi, M. Ed). Qom: Dar al-Qur'an al-Karim.
- Ghālib Ṭuwayl, M. (1966 AD/1386 AH). *Tārīkh al-‘Alawīyīn*. Beirut: Dar al-Andalus.
- Karājākī, M. (2015 AD/1394 SH). *Ma'dan al-Jawāhir*. (Husayni, A. Ed). Qom: Mehr Ostwar.
- Karājākī, M. (1989 AD/1410 AH). *Kanz al-Fawā'id*. Qom: Dar al-Dhakha'ir.
- Kashshī, M. (1988 AD/1409 AH). *Ikhtiyār Ma'rifat al-Rijāl (Rijāl Kashshī)*. (Mustafavi, Ed). Mashhad: Ferdowsi University.
- Māmaqānī, A. (1990 AD/1369 SH). *Talkhīṣ Miqbās al-Hidāyah*. (Ghaffari, A. Ed). Tehran: Imam Sadeq (AS) University.
- Majlisī, M. (1983). *Biḥār al-Anwār*. Beirut: Offset.
- Mūsawī, A. M. (1989 AD/1368 SH). "Treatises on the Interpretation and Sciences of the Quran Attributed to the Ahl al-Bayt (AS)." *Keyhan Andishe*. No. 28.
- Najāshī, A. (1986 AD/1407 AH). *Rijāl Najāshī*. (Zanjani, Ed). Qom: Nashr Islami.
- Nu'mānī, M. (1977 AD/1397 AH). *al-Ghaybah*. Tehran: Nashr Ṣadūq. **145**



پروہشگاہ علوم انسانی و مطالعات فرهنگی
پرتال جامع علوم انسانی