

Comparative Investigation the Methods of Encouraging and Punishing Architectural Students in Design Studios in Physical and Virtual Learning Version; Instructor's Viewpoint

^{1*} Kimia Sadat Tabibzadeh, ² Seyed Mohsen Moosavi, ³ Mohammad Parva

^{1*} PhD in Architecture, Department of Architecture, Shiraz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Shiraz, Iran

² Assistant Professor of Architecture, Faculty of Art and Architecture, University of Mazandaran, Babolsar, Iran

³ Assistant Professor of Architecture, Department of Architecture, Shiraz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Shiraz, Iran

Received 2024.08.29 ; Accepted 2024.12.16

ABSTRACT: Focusing on the methods of encouraging and punishing architectural design students, the current research has compared this topic in two methods of face-to-face and virtual education so that the results can be considered as a strategy used by professors in teaching architectural design courses. The present research has been done by comparative analogy method through content analysis with the help of library studies and survey in the form of analysis of available resources as well as interviews with fifteen instructors of architectural design who have more than ten years of teaching experience in this field. Considering the analysis of interviews and their coding and comparing the ways of encouraging and punishing students in physical and virtual education of architectural design courses. The professors emphasized that, in general, the type of behavior, the type of speech, the nature of the lesson, the student's ability, physical condition, and mental condition are among the things that should be considered in encouraging and punishing students. Considering that corporal punishment is not correct and can also question the self-esteem of people, the teacher must consider the best way of punishment for wrongdoers according to the mentioned cases. On the other hand, it should be avoided to encourage a person in the class constantly or to encourage a specific person because of good behavior in the class, and encouragement and punishment should be done only because of academic issues.

Keywords: Encouragement, Punishment, Architectural Design, Physical training, Virtual training.

INTRODUCTION

Encouragement and punishment are two facts that generally occur and flow throughout life (Sadeghi Ardestani, 1987). We all have the power to influence the lives of those around us. Most of us have not received much approval and admiration in our lives. Most of us are not encouraged enough (Movahed, 2012). In letter 53 of Nahj al-Balaghah, Hazrat Ali (AS) said about the necessity of encouragement: "Remember them with kindness and constantly encourage them and count the important things they have done; Because remembering their good deeds will stimulate their courage (to more effort and movement) and encourage the rest of the work (to work and effort) by God's will" (Ramezani & Heydari, 2012).

A professor in the role of a human being who plays the role of teacher and teacher is a model of humanization, behavior reformer,

society reformer, study guide, judge and evaluator, social worker and educational consultant, cultural carrier, and a member of society. Since the nature of the architecture field is different from other fields (in addition to theory courses, it also has workshop courses, and people learn in workshops with a flexible approach), encouraging and punishing architecture students is more extensive.

The outbreak of the COVID-19 disease significantly affected all fields of study and forced people to formulate new strategies to adapt to this situation (Ozorhon & Lekesiz, 2021). During the epidemic of this disease, educational systems underwent many changes; the complete closure of schools and universities was observed around the world, and learning turned to digital learning as a solution to maintain the mission of the educational system (Bouktif & Manzoor, 2021).

*Corresponding Author Email: Kimia.tabibzadeh@yahoo.com

Education in Iran, including architectural education, was not exempt from this. Focusing on the methods of encouraging and punishing architectural design students, the current research has compared this issue in two methods, face-to-face, and virtual education, so that the results can be considered as a strategy used by professors in teaching architectural design courses. In fact, the present research was carried out with the aim of improving the means of encouragement and punishment in face-to-face and virtual education based on the different experiences of professors, as well as improving the quality of face-to-face and virtual education of architectural design, especially its virtual education, and sought to answer the following two questions: 1- What are the differences between encouraging and punishing students in architectural design courses in face-to-face and virtual education? 2- What are the solutions that can be presented to professors in the subject of architectural design courses to improve the quality of teaching these courses by encouraging and punishing students?

Review of the Related Literature

Mousavi and Akbarzadeh (2021), using the qualitative method of grounded theory during a semi-open interview with Mazandaran University architecture students, concluded that the physical body of the class is effective in persuading architecture students to do a group workshop.

Moosavi et al. (2019), in research with the qualitative method of grounded theory, investigated the effective factors in the learning process of the students of architectural design courses and found that the use of the "pencil" model caused a sincere relationship between the professor and the student and the development of the student's creative ideas; the teacher's influence on group and collaborative activities.

An article titled "Effective Factors on the Online Education of the Architectural Design Workshop, a case study of the Faculty of Architecture and Urban Planning of Shahid Beheshti University during the outbreak of Covid-19 (Shariatirad, 2021) with the grounded theory method, it was concluded that positive thinking and trust building towards virtual space, The possibility of holding a workshop with a limit on the number of people and times and preparing a virtual platform for others, using multi-purpose and multi-purpose software environments, the possibility of accessing high-speed Internet, paying attention to collective learning in addition to the individual learning of students, variety of workshop exercises and activities, appropriate time distribution Corrections during the week, teacher-student interactions, paying attention to student participation and using a variety of visual media make computer-aided learning forms more efficient and flexible.

An article titled "Challenges of Students in online architectural design courses in Iran during the COVID-19 Epidemic" (Asadpour, 2021) has determined the understanding of architecture students about virtual education with a descriptive-analytical method and at the end it has been determined that it should be defined Redesign the education system based on the new framework of sustainable education.

In research entitled "The impact of the Covid-19-Corona virus on education and sustainable learning in architectural engineering" (Abdelmoneim Khogali, 2020), during quantitative research with a descriptive-analytical method, the problems of architectural education in the Faculty of Darul Oloom were addressed and solutions such as

WhatsApp interactions, class time sharing, IT problem solving were provided.

In a research titled "Transferring the Challenges of Covid-19 to Learning Potentials: Online Workshops of Architectural Education" (Milovanović et al., 2020) to the change in architectural education regarding the need to develop new approaches in teaching methods, improve curricula and progress in the fields of New learning and digital environment are addressed.

In a research titled "Organization of the learning process from the distance education system in the field of Architecture" (Hashemnazhad et al., 2010) with a semi-experimental method to quantitative-qualitative evaluation of students in university courses and a comparative comparison between the learning rate (two groups: 1- students who have chosen the traditional education method. 2- Students who have chosen distance education), and it has been concluded that the distance education system can be used as a new method in the education of architecture education students, but using this system in providing theoretical courses with art and basic sciences and practical courses with basic sciences and artistic nature is different. Also, the type and method of media implementation and the reduction of face-to-face contact between the learner and the teacher vary depending on the nature and difficulty level of different courses.

On the other hand, much research has been done so far in the field of encouragement and punishment. For example, Hasan Qolipour et al. (2010), in research with a descriptive-analytical method and a survey and causal data collection method, have studied the effect of incentive support programs on the export performance of companies. They have found that these programs indirectly have a positive effect on the export strategy of the companies and, as a result, the export performance of the companies.

Momtahe (2012) found out that with the descriptive-analytical method, Saadi Shirazi emphasized spiritual encouragement rather than material encouragement and considered punishment as one of the principles that educate a person on the right path.

Encouragement and punishment

Encouraging by the word means creating love and interest, and punishing means informing and warning (Jahangard, 1982). Encouragement is considered a suitable factor in motivating people to achieve the goals of education and a means to strengthen people in good ways and encourage them to try, as well as provide sufficient vitality in education (Mahdavi & Zarsazan, 2006). In psychology, encouragement is referred to as "positive reinforcement" and is the best and most effective method of increasing behavior (Azardashti, 1995). Punishment, in the term, is considered an action that requires awareness and alertness. It seems that the word punishment, contrary to popular belief, does not necessarily mean hitting and doing violence; Rather, it is the aspect of making a person aware of situations and conditions in that they are not aware of their behavior (Mousavi, 2014). Therefore, any blame and punishment that has the aspect of awareness is punishment (Shameli et al., 2011). Reward and punishment are often thought of as opposing forces that drive our behavior. However, reward is of primary importance Because we don't need to avoid a behavior unless we are first motivated to do it positively. In addition, terms such

as wanting, liking, reinforcement, reward, motivation, pleasure, desire, and motivation have specific meanings in the context of motivation (Freed, 2022).

The effects of encouragement and punishment and their methods

Reinforcement or motivation is a term with very complex dimensions that affect or are affected by student learning. "Teachers/coaches always use extrinsic" forms of motivation such as rewards and punishments to modify or stimulate some form of behavior (Eze & Udeh, 2022). Reward and punishment change the reward structures of social interactions and can potentially play a role in promoting social behavior (Junhui et al., 2022). Encouragement and punishment are considered two educational methods that should be used according to the regulations and with discipline in educational environments so that the health of the community, home, and school can be done properly. Encouragement is used when we want the student's good and desirable behavior to be repeated and become a habit, But punishment is used to weaken or end the student's bad behavior (Momtahan, 2012). The findings of research on employees have shown that reward and punishment policies affect increasing their productivity (Faiqoh et al., 2022; Mahayasa & Wardani, 2022; Bernada; Dewi & Landra, 2022; Olivia & Lestariningsih, 2022; Rismawati et al., 2022; Siswanto et al., 2022). Research results have shown that higher reactivity to punishment has a direct negative effect on physical and verbal aggression and inhibits aggressive behavior (Megias-Robles et al., 2022).

Reinforcing and punishing reinforces persistent behaviors and drives learning throughout the brain (Szadai et al., 2022). Previous studies have shown that the cerebral cortex exhibits different activation patterns in response to feedback (Iribe-Burgos et al., 2022). Thorndike, who was one of the scholars of education in the late 19th century, stated about this issue in the form of the "law of effect": "Whenever there is a pleasant relationship between the stimulus and the response, that relationship is strengthened, and whenever there is an unpleasant relationship between the stimulus and the response, that response is destroyed" (Azardashti, 1995).

The results of a study have shown that changes in the type of feedback affect cortical activity and behavioral execution during decision-making. That reward is associated with a fast emotional response strategy, and punishment is associated with slower and possibly more rational responses. In this way, in the reward condition, the more points the participant collects, the sooner the work is finished, While in the punishment condition, the more points accumulated, the longer the task takes (Iribe-Burgos et al., 2022).

The provision of stimuli by teachers in the form of rewards and punishments has a great impact on the behavior of students in achieving the goals of character education or discipline that have been determined (Adni et al., 2022). Encouragement and punishment have a positive and significant effect on work motivation (Sulistiyani, 2022). The method of encouraging and punishing is to use manners to excite and deter and flourish the individual's talents in order to reach absolute perfection (Mahdavi-rad & Zarsazan, 2006), which in the field of action can lead to correct education through knowledge, affection, delicacy, and accuracy (Momtahan, 2012).

It is necessary to pay attention to the time of encouragement and the personal characteristics of each person in the way of encouragement (Azardashti, 1995). Punishment is different from reinforcement, both in terms of method and in terms of application conditions, Although they may have the same result in some cases. Reinforcement is associated with positive and negative factors, but punishment is associated with the presence of a negative stimulus and the absence of a positive stimulus. Reinforcement is effective in creating or increasing the desired behavior, but punishment may eventually have harmful consequences for both the punisher and the punisher (Hasani, 2000). Rewarding good performance is better than punishing mistakes (Kosheleva et al., 2022). A timely encouragement and punishment, according to its necessary conditions, can lead a person's life from a deviant path to the right path, and on the contrary, inappropriate encouragement and punishment can lead to another person's error and misfortune (Il., 1986).

The way of loving in all aspects of life causes the formation of self-esteem in humans. Paying attention to the individual differences of people can lead to the evolution and progress of society (Kiyani & Bakhtiar Nasrabadi, 2011). Encouragement should be adequate, and in no way should it exceed the limit because it causes a person's ruin. On the other hand, the encouragement should not be less than the size because it will not achieve the desired result. "Hazrat Ali" has said in this regard that: "Praise more than merit is flattery and less than merit is helplessness and envy" (Aslani et al, 2010).

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The research method used in the current study was the content analysis method. Thus, after library studies through available sources (books and articles) and categorizing different ways of encouraging and punishing students, an interview was conducted with architecture professors about different ways of encouraging and punishing students.

Interview with 15 architectural design professors of the faculties of art and architecture in Shiraz (professors of 1- Shiraz University, 2- Shiraz Islamic Azad University, 3- Hafez Shiraz Higher Education Institute, 4- Apadana Shiraz Higher Education Institute) who have more than ten years of teaching experience in the field of teaching architectural design courses, it was done. Through the method of content analysis, a comparative comparison of the methods of encouraging and punishing architectural design courses in two types of face-to-face and virtual education was done).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

The methods of encouragement in face-to-face teaching of architectural design courses according to professors are specified in Table 1. According to the content analysis conducted during the interview with the professors, it has been determined that they use three general methods (speech, behavior, and tools) to encourage students.

In addition to the methods of encouraging students in face-to-face and virtual education of architectural design courses, their methods of punishment have also been investigated, which is specified in Table 2.

Table 1. Methods of encouraging students in face-to-face and virtual teaching of architectural design courses based on interviews with professors (source: authors)

Virtual Training				Face-to-Face Training			
Category	Subcategory	Concepts	Codes	Category	Subcategory	Concepts	Codes
defining the student's work in front of other students; Defining the positive aspects of the student's work in front of other students	Encouragement with words	speech	Encouragement	defining the student's work in front of other students; Defining the positive aspects of the student's work in front of other students	Encouragement with words	speech	Encouragement
Kindly talk to the students	talking			Kindly talk to the students	talking		
smiling and confirming the students' statements with a nod as encouragement, Clapping for students	Use body language	Behavior		smiling and confirming the students' statements with a nod as encouragement, Clapping for students	Use body language	Behavior	
Attention to the situation and conditions of students; Situation and circumstances	Conditions			Attention to the situation and conditions of students; Situation and circumstances	Conditions		
In positive comments or adding students' grades	Score	Tool		In positive comments or adding students' grades	Score	Tool	
Giving more time to work	Time			Giving more time to work	Time		
More corrections; Publication of students' works as encouragement; Setting up an exhibition of students' works as encouragement; inviting a professor or an expert in the field of the desired design topic during the semester to talk to the students; Collaborate on a project	Award			Tool	giving away a specialized book in the field of architectural design; Gifting architectural design tools (e.g., Rando magic, pencil.)		
		More corrections; Publication of students' works as encouragement; Setting up an exhibition of students' works as encouragement; academic excursion in the field of architectural design with the permission of the university; Offer their work and salary; inviting a professor or an expert in the field of the desired design topic during the semester to talk to the students; Collaborate on a project					

Table 2. Methods of punishing students in face-to-face teaching of architectural design courses based on interviews with professors (source: authors)

Virtual Training				Face-to-Face Training			
Category	Subcategory	Concepts	Codes	Category	Subcategory	Concepts	Codes
Students quarrel with words away from the eyes of others. Remind students to state the consequences of what the student does.	Punishment with words	speech	Punishment	Not talking to the student or looking meaningfully at him, not allowing the student to speak, quarreling with words away from the eyes of others, reminding students, and stating the consequences of what the student does.	Punishment with words	speech	Punishment
Attention to the situation and conditions of students; Situation and circumstances	Conditions	Behavior		A meaningful look at the student	Use body language	Behavior	
In negative consideration or reduction of students' grades	Score	Tool		Attention to the situation and conditions of students; Situation and circumstances	Conditions		
Too much homework; request more work; Requesting more details of the plan (different perspectives from the corners of the work); request more sheets; Providing a class to students on a specialized subject in the field of study; see more examples and present them to the teacher or the whole class; sketches; Deprivation of correction	penalty			In negative consideration or reduction of students' grades	Score	Tool	
				Too much homework; request more work; Requesting more details of the plan (different perspectives from the corners of the work); request more sheets; Providing a class to students on a specialized subject in the field of study; see more case examples and present them to the professor or the whole class; sketches; to be deprived of correction; Being deprived of a class session; separating a person from others in any way; Doing side jobs	penalty		

Discussion

Table 1 shows that praising the student's work in front of other students and praising the positive aspects of the student's work in front of other students from the concept of "encouraging with words" related to the subcategory of "speech", talking kindly to students from the concept of "talking" related to the subcategory of "speech", smiling and confirming the students' statements with the head as encouragement and shaking hands for the students from the concept of "using body language" related to the subcategory of "behavior", paying attention to the situation and conditions of the students and the situation and conditions arising from the concept of "conditions" related to the subcategory of "behavior", in considering positively or adding students' grades from the concept of "grade" related to the subcategory of "tools", giving more time to advance the work than the concept of "time" related to the subcategory of "tools", giving gifts a specialized book in the field of architectural design and gifting architectural design tools (e.g. Rando Magic, Rwanovis, .) from the concept of "prize" related to the subcategory of "tools", more corrections, publishing students' works as encouragement, setting up an exhibition of students' works as encouraging, academic excursion in the field of architectural design with the permission of the university, offering him a job and

salary, inviting a professor or an expert in the field of the desired design subject during the semester to talk with the students and collaborate on a project from the concept of "Special Award" related to the subcategory of "Tools", it has been one of the various methods of encouraging architectural design students in face-to-face education, which is done in a more limited way and with less variety in virtual education.

Table 2 indicates that not talking to the student or looking meaningfully at him, not allowing the student to talk, arguing with the student verbally away from the eyes of others, warning students, stating the consequences of what the student does, from the concept of "punishment with words" related to "speech", a meaningful look at the student from the concept of using body language related to the subcategory "behavior", paying attention to the situation and conditions of students and the situation and conditions arising from the concept of "conditions" related to the subcategory "behavior", in the negative consideration or reduction of the students' score from the concept of the score related to the subcategory of "tools", too much homework, asking for more work, asking for more details of the plan (different perspectives from every corner of the work), asking for more sheets;

giving a class presentation to students about a specialized subject in the field of study, seeing more case examples and presenting it to the professor or the whole class, sketches, being deprived of correction, being deprived of a class meeting, separating the person from others in any way and doing side works from the concept of "penalty" related to "tool" are methods of punishing architectural design students in face-to-face education, which are more limited and with less variety in virtual education.

According to the opinion of the professors, professors of architecture schools can use many methods and ways to encourage and punish students, and each of them will be effective at different times. In addition, the mentioned examples are stated according to the intensity and weakness considered. For example, a professor who offers cooperation in a project or offers a job and salary to a student as encouragement is considered the highest degree of encouragement, or vice versa, when the professor decides to refer the student to the disciplinary committee or the student. He warns that he has to remove his lesson; he has considered the highest degree of punishment for him, all of which are expressed through the tools in the hands of the professor in relation to the action done by the student.

The professors emphasized that, in general, the type of behavior, the type of speech, the nature of the lesson, the student's ability, physical condition, and mental condition are among the things that should be considered in encouraging and punishing students. Considering that corporal punishment is not correct and can also question the self-esteem of people, the teacher must consider the best way of punishment for wrongdoers according to the mentioned cases. On the other hand, it should be avoided to encourage a person in the class constantly or to encourage a particular person because of good behavior in the class, and encouragement and punishment should be done only because of academic issues. In fact, ways of encouraging and punishing may be created through education, science, and behavior. The teacher should consider that encouragement and punishment are for education. For example, if a person has good behavior, there is no reason to encourage him, or if someone is mischievous, reducing his grade should not be used to punish him. Finally, it can be said that, in general, the ways of encouraging and punishing students in the Faculty of Architecture can be divided into three factors. It is important to consider the dependent factors: professor, student, and situation.

CONCLUSION

In the following article, which was conducted using the content analysis method with the help of interview tools, the methods of encouraging and punishing architectural design students in face-to-face and virtual education were categorized from the professors' point of view, and it was found that three general methods: speech, behavior, and tools are the methods that Professors use them to encourage and punish students. After that, in order to answer the first and second questions of the research about determining the methods of encouraging and punishing architectural design students, through the content analysis of interviews with professors, it was found that professors try to make the best decision to encourage and punish

them and these methods have similarities and differences in face-to-face and virtual education.

According to the professors, the most widely used method of encouraging and punishing students in architectural design courses, both in face-to-face and virtual education, is related to the subcategory of tools, which includes the following things to encourage: publication of students' works, setting up an exhibition of Students' works, inviting a professor or an expert in the field of the desired design topic during the semester to talk with the students, offering cooperation in a project and offering work and salary to the student, more corrections, giving more time to advance the work and of all It is more important to give more marks. Asking for more details of the plan (different perspectives from the corner of the project), asking for more sheets of sketches, seeing more examples and presenting it to the professor verbally or presenting it to the whole class formally in the form of a PowerPoint file, as well as presenting a class in the field of a specialized topic In the field of lessons, they are among the things that are used as a tool by the teacher for punishment.

Carefully, in tables number one and two, which show a comparative comparison of face-to-face and virtual education of architectural design courses in both face-to-face and virtual education, it can be seen that in face-to-face and virtual education, the methods of encouragement are the same difference in face-to-face education, students encouraged through behavior with the concept of the award including: gifting a specialized book in the field of architectural design and gifting architectural design tools (e.g., magic rando, pencil writer, .). In addition, encouragement through tools with the concept of special privilege, including an academic tour in the field of architectural design with the permission of the university and offering him work and salary, is also considered one of the examples of encouraging students in the face-to-face education of architectural design courses, which is carried out in the virtual education of these courses. Can't Regarding the methods of punishing students in face-to-face and virtual education, it can be emphasized that in face-to-face education, the punishment of architectural design students is also done through the concept of using body language, and the concept of punishment is more extensive by being deprived of a class session. Separating a person from others in any way and doing side work, as well as not talking to the student or looking meaningfully at him and not allowing the student to talk, is done through the concept of verbal punishment.

According to the analysis, it can be said that the methods of encouragement and punishment are generally the same because, in both types of education, all three general methods are used, i.e., speech, behavior, and tools, but the way of using each of these methods It is different in face-to-face and virtual education. It has been associated with restrictions for teachers in virtual education. In response to the second question of the research regarding the determination of the solutions that can be presented in the title of architectural design courses to the professors in order to improve the quality of the teaching of these courses by encouraging and punishing the students, [Table 3](#) is presented according to the opinions of the professors based on the content analysis.

Table 3. The solutions that can be presented in the subject of architectural design courses to professors in order to improve the quality of teaching these courses by encouraging and punishing architecture students based on interviews with professors (source: authors)

Punishment	Encouragement
Not talking to the student or looking meaningfully at them	Defining the student's work in front of other students
Not allowing the student to speak.	Defining the positive aspects of the student's work in front of other students
Students arguing with words away from the eyes of others	Kindly talk to the students.
Remind students	Smiling and confirming what the students say with a nod as encouragement
State the consequences of what the student does.	Clapping for students
A meaningful look at the student	Paying attention to the situation and conditions of students and deciding on the best method of encouragement
Paying attention to the situation and conditions of students and deciding on the best method of punishment	
Paying attention to the situation and circumstances and deciding on the best method of punishment	Paying attention to the situation and circumstances and deciding on the best way to encourage
In negative consideration or reduction of students' grades	In positive comments or adding students' grades
Much homework	Giving more time to work
Request more work	Giving a specialized book in the field of architectural design as a gift
Requesting more details of the plan (different perspectives from the corners of the work)	Gifting architectural design tools (e.g., Rando magic, pencil.)
Request more sheets	More corrections
Presenting a class to students on a specialized subject in the field of study	Publication of students' works as encouragement
See more case examples and present them to the professor or the whole class	Setting up an exhibition of students' works as encouragement
sketches	Scientific excursion in the field of architectural design with the permission of the university
Deprivation of correction	Job offers and salary to the student
Exclusion from a class session	Inviting a professor or an expert in the field of the desired design topic during the semester to talk to the students
Separating a person from others in any way	
Doing side jobs	Collaborate on a project.

The results of the present research can be taken into consideration when revising the title of architecture courses and can be used as a strategy in teaching architectural design courses. Future researchers are suggested to make a comparative comparison of face-to-face and virtual teaching methods of different courses in architecture and compare the results of this type of training so that it can be used in revising the subject of the courses.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

The literature review, collection and classification of findings, and discussion conclusion were carried out by the first author. Guidance during the writing process, participation in the classification of findings,

and final review were carried out by the second author, and the idea for writing the article and final review was carried out by the third author.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We thank the professors who participated in the interviews.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The authors declare no potential conflict of interest regarding the publication of this work. In addition, the authors have witnessed ethical issues, including plagiarism, informed consent, misconduct, data fabrication or falsification, double publication and submission, and redundancy.

REFERENCES

- Abdelmoneim Khogali H. (2020). The Effect of COVID-19 CORONA VIRUS on Sustainable Teaching and Learning in Architecture Engineering. *Canadian Center of Science and Education*, 14 (8), 44-58.
- Adni, I, Bustanur B, Andrizar A. (2022). evaluasi metode reward and punishment untuk kedisiplinan siswa di mi muhammadiyah pebaun hilir kecamatan kuantan mudik kabupaten kuantan singingi. *jom ftk UNIKS (Jurnal Online Mahasiswa FTK UNIKS)*, 3(1), 99-103
- Aslani I, Majadfar M, Salighehdar L. (2010). Effective methods of encouragement and punishment in education. *Development of Elementary Education*, (4), 18-32. (In Persian).
- Asadpour A. (2021). Student challenges in online architectural design courses in Iran during the COVID-19 pandemic. *E-Learning and Digital Media*.
- Azardashti A. (1995). The place of encouragement and punishment in education. *Education*, 11 (6), 23-27. (In Persian).
- Bernada Olivia D, Lestariningsih M. (2022). pengaruh reward dan punishment terhadap kinerja pegawai dengan disiplin kerja sebagai variabel intervening pada dinas kesehatan provinsi jawa timur. *Jurnal Ilmu dan Riset Manajemen*, Vol 11, No 5.
- Bouktif S, Manzoor A. (2021). Artificial Intelligence as a Gear to Preserve Effectiveness of Learning and Educational Systems in Pandemic Time. *IEEE Education Engineering (EDUCON)*.
- Eze G. U, Udeh I. L. (2022). THE ROLE OF REWARD AND PUNISHMENT ON STUDENTS' ACADEMIC PERFORMANCE IN SECONDARY SCHOOL EDUCATION. *Journal of Educational Research & Development*, 5(1).
- Faiqoh F, Naim S, Rahmanudin D, Hayati F. A, Mokodenseho S. (2022). The Effect of Reward and Punishment Policy on the Productivity of BPJS Health Employees Kotabumi Branch Office. *Jurnal Studi Manajemen Pendidikan*, Vol. 6, No. 1, 49-60.
- Freed W. J. (2022). Reward, Punishment, Desire, Pleasure, and Terminology. *In Motivation and Desire* (pp. 7-13). Springer, Cham.
- Hasan Qolipour T, Motevaseli M, Mohammadi Sh, Hosseini F. (2010). The effect of export promotion programs on export performance: a case study of the electricity industry. *Business Administration*, 2 (5): 1-20. (In Persian).
- Hasani S. J. (2000). Analytical investigation of punishment from the point of view of narrative. *Jurisprudence and psychology, knowledge* (33). (In Persian).
- Hashemnazhad H, Hosseini S.B, Vaziri, V. (2010). Organizing the Phenomenon of Distance Education in the Field of Architecture, *Journal of Technology of Education*, 4 (3), 201-212.
- Il M. (1986). The use of encouragement and punishment methods in education. *Education Quarterly*, (7 and 8): 87-110. (In Persian).
- Iribe-Burgos F. A, Cortes P. M, García-Hernández J. P, Sotelo-Tapia C, Hernández-González M, Guevara M. A. (2022). Effect of reward and punishment on no-risk decision-making in young men: An EEG study. *Brain Research*, 1779, 147788.
- Jahangard Y. (1982). Encouragement and punishment in terms of education. *Link*, (37): 32-37. (In Persian).
- Junhui Wu, Shenghua L, Nichola, R (2022). Reward, punishment, and prosocial behavior: Recent developments and implications, *Current Opinion in Psychology*, Volume 44, 117-123.
- Kiyani S, Bakhtiar Nasrabadi, H.A. (2011). Objectives, principles, and methods of moral education from the point of view of Khwaja Nasiruddin Tusi, *Research in Islamic education issues*, 19 (12): 65-94. (In Persian).
- Kosheleva, O, Urenda J, Kreinovich, V. (2022). Reward for Good Performance Works Better Than Punishment for Mistakes: Economic Explanation. *International Conference of the Thailand Econometrics Society*. (pp. 121-126). Springer, Cham.
- Mahayasa, I. G. A, Wardani N. K. A. D. (2022). PENGARUH KETERAMPILAN KERJA, REWARD DAN PUNISHMENT TERHADAP KINERJA KARYAWAN. *Journal of Applied Management Studies (JAMMS)*, 3(2), 115-127.
- Mahdavarad M. A, Zarsazan A. (2006). The method of human education in the life of the prophets from the perspective of the Holy Quran. *Religious research*, (14): 143-164. (In Persian).
- Megías-Robles A, Gómez-Leal R, Gutiérrez-Cobo M. J, Cabello R, Fernández-Berrocal P. (2022). "The role of sensitivity to reward and punishment in aggression. *Journal of interpersonal violence*, 37(13-14).
- Milovanović A, Kostić M, Zorić, A, Đorđević A, Pešić M, Bugarski J, Todorović D, Sokolović N, Josifovski A. (2020). Transferring COVID-19 Challenges into Learning Potentials: Online Workshops in Architectural Education. *Sustainability*, 12 (17): 1-21.
- Momtaten M. (2012). Analysis of didactic-educational images of encouragement and punishment in Saadi's works, *Journal of Educational Literature*, 14 (15): 157-176. (In Persian).
- Moosavi S.M, Saghafi M.R, Mozaffar F, Izadi S. (2019). Achieving an Effective Teaching Model in Architectural Education; Case Study: Architectural Design Basics Two. *ARMANSHAHR*, 12 (28): 103-114.
- Movahed S. (2012). You scored twenty yourself! *The weekly success magazine*, (246), 29. (In Persian).
- Mousavi S.A. (2014). Punishment of the child from the perspective of the parties. *Educational jurisprudence studies*, 1 (2): 127-154. (In Persian).
- Mousavi S.M, Akbarzadeh Z. (2021). Determining the physical components effective on improving teamwork in architecture studios (case study: architecture classes of Mazandaran University). *Biannual Journal of Architectural Thought*, 5 (9): 250-262. (In Persian).
- OZORHONG, LEKESÍZ G. (2021). Re-considering the Architectural Design Studio after Pandemic: Tools, Problems, Potentials, *Journal of Design Studio*, 3 (1): 19-36.
- Ramezani F, Heydari M. (2012). Methods of social education of children based on Quran and Nahj al-Balagha, *research in curriculum planning*. 9 (6): 1-20. (In Persian).

Rismawati R, Rinda R. T, Subakti J. (2022). PENGARUH REWARD AND PUNISHMENT TERHADAP KINERJA KARYAWAN. *Manager: Jurnal Ilmu Manajemen*, 5(2), 161-164.

Shameli N, Ali Akbari Babukani E, Shakeri M. (2011). Examining the limits and limitations of punishment, curtailment, and discipline of children in Imamiyyah jurisprudence. *Quarterly Journal of Islamic Jurisprudence and Law Studies*, 7 (25): 67-98. (In Persian).

Shariatirad F, Dostabadi A, Dehbandi M, Sanmari F. (2021). Factors affecting the online education of the architectural design workshop, a case study of the Faculty of Architecture and Urban Planning of Shahid Beheshti University during the outbreak of Covid. *SOFFEH*, 19, 31 (2) and Papi (93): 61-82. (In Persian).

Sadeghi Ardestani A. (1987). Reward and punishment. *Link*, (91):

14-17. (In Persian).

Siswanto Z. M. M, Fitriani F, Amelia R. (2022). Pengaruh Reward Dan Punishment Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan Pada PT. Mitra Megah Profitamas Banjarmasin. *BIMA: Jurnal Bisnis dan Manajemen*, 1(1), 34-40.

Sulistiyani F. (2022). PENGARUH REWARD DAN PUNISHMENT TERHADAP MOTIVASI KERJA SERTA DAMPAKNYA TERHADAP LOYALITAS KARYAWAN PADA PT. JATINOM INDAH AGRI (Divisi Poultry Shop) (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang) .

Szadai Z, Pi, H. J, Chevy Q, Ócsai K, Albeanu F, Chiovini, B, ..., & Rózsa B. (2022). Cortex-wide fast activation of VIP-expressing inhibitory neurons by reward and punishment. *bioRxiv*.

